#### FORT LAUDERDALE POLICE DEPARTMENT

DATE:

MARCH 19, 2015

TO:

Franklin C. Adderley / Chief of Police

FROM:

Douglas MacDougall / Assistant Chief-Operations Bureau / tcq

SUBJECT:

Internal Affairs Investigation No.14-090 Police Officer Alex Alvarez (CCN 1850) Police Officer Jason Holding (CCN 1843) Police Officer James Wells (CCN 1786)

Police Officer Christopher Sousa (CCN 1793)

After careful review of the evidence and testimony in the above captioned investigation, I concur with the findings of Internal Affairs Major Karen Dietrich that the allegation Officers Alex Alvarez, Jason Holding, James Wells and Christopher Sousa violated the following Fort Lauderdale Police Department policies are sustained.

118 E 12 (h), "Engaging in conduct prejudicial to the good order of the department";

118 E 12 (d), "Conduct unbecoming a police officer."

I recommend that the employment of Officers Jason Holding, James Wells and Christopher Sousa be terminated with the City of Fort Lauderdale. I would also recommend the employment of Officer Alex Alvarez be terminated with the City of Fort Lauderdale, however, he resigned not in good standing during the course of this investigation.

DM/ar



#### FORT LAUDERDALE POLICE DEPARTMENT

DATE:

March 18, 2015

TO:

Franklin C. Adderley/ Chief of Police

FROM:

Major Karen Dietrich/ Office of Internal Affairs

SUBJECT:

Internal Affairs Case No. 14-090

Police Officer Alex Alvarez (CCN 1850)
Police Officer Jason Holding (CCN 1843)
Police Officer James Wells (CCN 1786)
Police Officer Christopher Sousa (CCN 1793)

After careful review of the evidence and testimony in the captioned investigation, I have determined the allegations that Officer Alex Alvarez, Officer Jason Holding, Officer James Wells, and Officer Christopher Sousa violated Fort Lauderdale Police Department Policies 118 E (12) H "Engaging in conduct prejudicial to the good order of the department" and 118E (12) D "Conduct unbecoming a police officer" are sustained.

October 16, 2014, Ms. Priscilla Perez sent Franklin C. Adderley, Chief of Police, an e-mail indicating the department has racist police officers and provided him proof hoping he would extricate the problem. Chief Adderley replied to the email and advised he had not received the information she described and requested she resend the information to him. In response, the complainant separated and attached screenshots of text messages into a series of eleven emails to accommodate the numerous attachments. In turn, Chief Adderley forwarded the series of emails to the Office of Internal Affairs.

On October 17, 2014, Ms. Perez responded to the Office of Internal Affairs and provided Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes a sworn and digitally recorded statement. In addition, she provided an iPhone 5 which she advised belonged to her mother, and contained the screenshots of the text message conversations and an iMovie containing racist material.

During Ms. Perez's sworn statement, she advised Officer Alvarez displayed racist views the entire time she has known him. For the ten months she has known him, eight of those months they have been engaged. She stated Officer Alvarez demonstrated through his words and acts his negative views towards African Americans throughout their relationship and provided evidence to substantiate her allegations.

During the initial review of the screenshot text messages, it was discovered Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa were identified as owners of the phone numbers provided by Ms. Perez. One of the comments written by Officer Wells created the perception of a potential criminal violation including charges of falsification of an official police document as well as a violation of the Department's pursuit policy; however, this was disproven during the investigation.

In addition to the offensive references about African Americans, the evidence also revealed negative comments about Hispanics, homosexuals and their coworkers. Officers Sousa, Wells and Holding provided their statements to Internal Affairs. Officer Alvarez unexpectedly resigned the day prior to his compelled statement. During the sworn statements of the three remaining officers, they acknowledged authoring the comments which were attributed to each of their respective phone numbers.

All four officers authored texts messages that were racially offensive toward African Americans. Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells authored texts messages maligning their coworkers. Officers Alvarez and Wells each utilized the derogatory term faggot. Officer Holding described the female subject of a failed romantic endeavor as a "Fucking cuban" and "Fucking cuban elite."

Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells and Sousa's conduct is likely to have a negative impact on their interactions with the community and their coworkers as well as negatively affect their credibility in official proceedings.

I find the evidence and testimony in this case clearly supports the charge of "Conduct Unbecoming an Officer" on Alvarez, Wells, Holding and Sousa. Their comments were not in accordance with the standards appropriate to their positions as police officers.

According to the Florida Department of Law Enforcement (FDLE), Law Enforcement effectiveness depends upon community respect and confidence. Conduct which detracts from this respect and confidence is detrimental to the public interest and should be prohibited.

Florida Department of Law Enforcement Rule 3.2 dictates, "Police officers shall not express, whether by act, omission or statement, prejudice concerning race, color, creed, religion, national origin, sex, marital status, status with regard to public assistance, disability, sexual orientation or age."

These officers' conduct shed a negative light on themselves as police officers and the police department as a whole. Further, the disparaging comments about their coworkers are clearly disruptive to the good order of the department. Since the inception of this investigation, there have been multiple public records requests and media inquiries for this case, which will ultimately shed a negative light on this department as a whole. Therefore, the charge of "Engaging in conduct prejudicial to the good order of the department," on all four officers is also sustained.

Comp	olainant: <u>Pr</u>	iscilla Pere	z			Telephone:	305-301-5117		
Addre	ess: <u>481 N</u>	W 25 Aven	ue, Miami, FL 33	125					
Locati	ion of Occurr	ence: <u>13</u>	00 West Broward	d Blvd., F	ort Lauderd	ale, FL 33312			
	of Occurrence		eptember to Mid-				October 16, 2014		
Person Person Person	nnel: Offic	er Alex Alva er Jason H er James V er Christop	olding /ells	CCN: CCN: CCN:	1850 1843 1786 1793	Assignment: Assignment: Assignment: Assignment:	OPS/ Patrol/ Shift 2 OPS/ Patrol/ Shift 2 OPS/ Patrol/ Shift 2 OPS/ NAT/ Dist 1		
Report Number(s):						_ Case Category: _1 I.A.			
Office	ition(s):  r Alex Alvard  d violation of	ez:							
Alleged violation of Fort Lauderdale Police Department Policy:  1. 118 E 12 (d) "Engaging in conduct unbecoming a police officer/employee."									
			Not sustained_	_	•		nfounded		
2.	118 E 12 (i)	"Conduct p	rejudicial to the c	rood orde	er of the Der	nartment "			
	2. 118 E 12 (j) "Conduct prejudicial to the good order of the Der Sustained X Not sustained Exonerate				The state of the s	founded			
Officer	Jason Hold	ing:	•						
Alleged	violation of I	ort Lauder	dale Police Depa	artment F	olicy:	•			
1. 118 E 12 (d) "Engaging in conduct unbecoming a police officer/employee."									
	Sustained	<u>(</u>	Not sustained		Exonerated	dUnf	ounded		
<b>2.</b> 1	18 E 12 (j) "(	Conduct pre	judicial to the go	od order	of the Depa	artment."			
	<del></del> -	•	Not sustained		Exonerate		founded		

Officer James Wells:								
Alleged violation of I	Fort Lauderdale Police D	Department Policy:						
<b>1.</b> 118 E 12 (d) "Engag	ing in conduct unbecom	ing a police officer/emplo	oyee."					
Sustained X	Not sustained	Exonerated	Unfounded					
2. 118 E 12 (j) "Conduc	ct prejudicial to the good	order of the Department						
Sustained X	Not sustained	4.	Unfounded					
Officer Christopher Sousa								
Alleged violation of Fort Lauderdale Police Department Policy:								
1. 118 E 12 (d) "Engaging in conduct unbecoming a police officer/employee."								
	in also the contract of the co	Exonerated						
odotanied <u>x</u>								
<b>2.</b> 118 E 12 (j) "Conduc	of prejudicial to the good	order of the Department						
	the state of the s		 Unfounded					
Sustained X	Not sustained	_ Exollerated						
44/1	1							
M. Mancour	1/ 1379	- Kover 1	Onter non					
Investigated by:	vestigated by: REGEANT Francisco Vetancourt (CCN MAJOR Karen Dietrich (CCN 1191)							
1374)								
	111. III. I Affaire Affaire	ii walio wa						
STAFF REVIEW:   concur	with the internal Affairs i	inding.						
Police Chief			Date 3/14/13					
Assistant Chief	ADM		Date 3/19/15					
Assistant Chief/	evezi 1eu							
I do not concur with the Int	ernal Affairs finding. Att	ached is a separate men	no with my					
recommendation(s)			Doto					

#### **SUMMARY OF COMPLAINT**

On October 16, 2014, Police Chief Franklin C. Adderley received an email originating from email address, <a href="mailto:hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com">hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com</a> alleging to have knowledge of racism within the Fort Lauderdale Police Department. The author of the email advised she included a video made by Officer Alvarez that reportedly contained "racism comments, as well as shows his encouragement to the elimination of blacks, including KKK photos." The author also advised she included with her email, text messages obtained from Officer Alex Alvarez's iPhone 5 containing "racist conversations between Officers Alex Alvarez, James Wells, and Jason Holding."

Due to the large amount of data to be transmitted, the complainant separated and attached the screenshots of the text messages into a series of eleven emails. A review of the text messages raised concerns Officers Alvarez, Wells, Sousa, and Holding had engaged in conduct and utilized racially offensive language, which would reflect unfavorably on the Fort Lauderdale Police Department as well as their fellow officers.

An invitation to meet was extended to the complainant in an effort gather more information and authenticate the materials she provided. The complainant agreed to provide a statement in the matter. Upon meeting at the Office of Internal Affairs, the complainant was identified as Officer Alvarez's former fiancée, Ms. Priscilla Perez. She agreed to provide a sworn, digitally recorded statement as well as furnish the third party cellular phone she utilized to receive and distribute the images and video she retrieved from Officer Alvarez's cellular phone. Detective Raphael Fernandez, the Department's Digital Forensic Examiner, responded to the Office of Internal Affairs and performed a forensic digital extraction of the data stored on the provided cellular phone. Based on the testimony and evidence provided by Ms. Perez, an investigation was launched to determine if the aforementioned officers' alleged conduct and communications were in violation of Fort Lauderdale Police Department policy.

#### FACTS OF THE INVESTIGATION

On October 16, 2014, Police Chief Franklin C. Adderley received an email from <a href="https://hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com">hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com</a> alleging to have knowledge of racism within the Fort Lauderdale Police Department. The author of the email advised she included a video made by Officer Alvarez that contained "racism comments, as well as shows his encouragement to the elimination of blacks, including KKK photos." The author also advised she included with her email, text messages obtained from Officer Alex Alvarez's iPhone 5 containing "racist conversations between Officers Alex Alvarez, James Wells, and Jason Holding."

Chief Adderley replied to the complainant's email and advised he had not received the information she described. He requested she email the information to him. In response, the complainant separated and attached the screenshots of the text messages into a series of eleven emails to accommodate the numerous attachments. In turn, Chief Adderley forwarded the series of emails to Internal Affairs Major Karen Dietrich.

On October 17, 2014, Sergeants Cortes and Vetancourt reviewed the materials provided by the complainant. The review revealed multiple uses of racially derogatory terms referencing persons the

officers dealt with during the course of their duties as well as racially insensitive quotes and photographs from the film "Django Unchained." There were also text messages and photographs criticizing their coworkers, some of which are African Americans. The messages criticized their coworkers' grammar, appearance, work ethic and referred to an entire shift as "lazy fucks." The composition of the personnel criticized included various ethnicities and genders. The officers also exchanged text messages that included derogatory comments towards Hispanics and homosexuals. The phone numbers depicted in the text message screenshots were researched utilizing the I-Leads database and the Telestaff Scheduling Program. This was confirmed to correspond to Officer Alex Alvarez, Officer Jason Holding, Officer James Wells, and Officer Christopher Sousa. The video alleged to have been produced by Officer Alvarez was unable to be viewed as provided.

A possible criminal allegation was noted when a series of text messages were compared to the related police report. Officers Wells and Holding make references to "chasing off the grid" and "it was off the air until he hit 3 cars." A photograph of a white Mercedes Benz with front-end damage was included in the text message. Officers Wells' activity was researched utilizing a Broward County Sheriff's Office Advanced CAD Query, the vehicle was determined to be a white 2008 Mercedes Benz E350 reported stolen from 118 NW 5 Street on October 9, 2014. The victim, Mr. Guy Ehring, reported leaving the vehicle unsecured and had lost the spare vehicle key days prior to the Fort Lauderdale Police Department Offense Incident Report OR# 14-239794 chronicling the theft was authored by Officers Leo Arena and Justin Houston. Officer Wells completed Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplement Report (OR# 14-239794) detailing the recovery of the Mercedes Benz and the arrest of John Barnes.

Officer Wells' Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplement Report (OR# 14-239794) was reviewed. According to Officer Wells' supplemental report, he observed a Mercedes "swerving, failing to maintain his lane, following too close to the vehicles in front of it, and committed several improper lane changes" while driving east on Sunrise Boulevard. Officer Wells' narrative indicated the Mercedes continued east on Sunrise Boulevard however stopped at a red light at Sunrise Boulevard and Andrews Avenue. He proceeded to initiate a traffic stop by activating his overhead lights, at which point, the Mercedes made a sharp right turn from the turn lane. The Mercedes struck three vehicles in the process and continued eastbound on Sunrise Boulevard until it hit a curb and crashed into a tree at 200 East Sunrise Boulevard.

Officers Wells and Holding's text messages regarding the stolen Mercedes Benz implied Officer Wells may have engaged in a pursuit of a stolen car contrary to the Department's fleeing vehicle policy. If the text messages were a true representation of what occurred, then his sworn report would have contained falsifications.

On October 17, 2014, Sergeant Cortes contacted the complainant via email, and extended her the opportunity to provide a statement on the matter. The complainant responded to the email and expressed some concern regarding her identity being revealed to the accused officers. She indicated in her email to Sergeant Cortes "they know where I live and my routines."

The complainant contacted Sergeant Cortes multiple times via telephone and was ultimately identified as Officer Alvarez's former fiancée, Ms. Priscilla Perez. Ms. Perez was scheduled to provide a

statement later the same day as well as provide the cellular phone she utilized to capture and distribute Officer Alvarez's text messages and video.

On October 17, 2014, Detective Raphael Fernandez, the Department's Digital Forensic Examiner, responded to the Office of Internal Affairs. Detective Fernandez met Ms. Perez, addressed her concerns and answered her questions regarding the data extraction. Detective Fernandez received verbal consent to conduct the data retrieval from Ms. Perez and performed a forensic digital extraction of the data stored on the cellular phone. Ms. Perez also signed a "City of Fort Lauderdale Police Department Consent to Remove & Search Computer Equipment/Copy Electronic Data" form as well as a "Consent to Search Form (Electronic Media)" documenting her approval for Detective Fernandez to perform the "digital dump" of the phone's contents.

Ms. Perez provided Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes a sworn and digitally recorded statement. Prior to commencing the interview, Ms. Perez played, "The Hoods" iMovie on the cellular phone she brought to the interview. The iMovie opened with the credit "Uncle AI Films," and contained racially offensive captions including, "THEY WERE SAVAGE HUNTERS" AND "HOODS OF DEATH THE NIGGERS CALLED THEM." The iMovie also contained a caption that read "BUT ONE NIGGER WOULD CHANGE EVERYTHING," followed by an altered picture of President Barack Obama with gold teeth and a gold chain. Intertwined with the captions were images from the films "Django Unchained" and "Tusk," as well as an image of a Ku Klux Klan member wearing a white hood. The iMovie concluded with a credit section. The credit section included an entry of "AN ALEX ALVAREZ FILM," and listed Officers James Wells, Pedro Cabrera and K-9 Cannon, Vincent Schrider, Christopher Sousa, Jason Holding, as well as Detectives Timothy Shields and John Graul in various film production assignments.

During her interview, Ms. Perez detailed the alleged racist tendencies, her knowledge of the text message conversations, and "The Hoods" iMovie. Ms. Perez also presented the Office of Internal Affairs a Domestic Violence Pamphlet from the Miami-Dade Police Department to substantiate her assertion she contacted the police due to an argument with Officer Alvarez at their residence. The pamphlet noted the date of offense as October 13, 2014, the responding officers were MDPD Officer M. Tirado (ID# 4472) and MDPD Officer J. Perez (ID# 7356), and the police case number assigned as PD141013373467. Ms. Perez furnished the Office of Internal Affairs a letter from Doral View Apartments Property Manager Janet Hernandez, which documented Ms. Perez and Officer Alvarez terminated their lease on October 14, 2014, the day following the Miami-Dade Police response to their residence.

On October 17, 2014, due to the testimony and materials provided by Ms. Perez, Officers Alvarez and Wells were relieved from duty and issued a written direct order from Internal Affairs Major Karen Dietrich to refrain from having any contact with Ms. Perez. Officer Jason Holding was placed on restricted duty and issued a written direct order from Internal Affairs Major Karen Dietrich to refrain from having contact with Ms. Perez. On October 21, 2014, after returning from vacation, Officer Christopher Sousa was placed on restricted duty and issued a written direct order from Internal Affairs Major Karen Dietrich to refrain from having any contact with Ms. Perez.

On November 7, 2014, all of the available documentation regarding the arrest of Mr. Barnes in the stolen Mercedes Benz referenced in the text messages were reviewed.

Fort Lauderdale Police Offense Incident Report OR#14-239794 authored by Officers Leo Arena and Justin Houston titled "Auto Theft (Auto)" was reviewed. According to Officers Arena and Houston's report, they responded to 200 East Sunrise Boulevard regarding an "Auto Theft (Recovery)." The vehicle recovered was a white 2008 Mercedes Benz E350 bearing Florida Tag number They met with the owner of the vehicle, Mr. Guy Ehring, who reported leaving the vehicle unsecured at 118 NW 5 Street on October 9, 2014, and had lost the spare vehicle key days prior to the theft. Officers Arena and Houston noted Mr. Ehring signed the "VICTIM AFFIDAVIT/AFFIDAVIT OF PROSECTUTION" indicating his desire to pursue charges against the party responsible for the theft of his vehicle.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplement Report OR#14-239794 authored by Officer James Wells was reviewed. According to Officer Wells' narrative, he observed a white Mercedes "swerving, failing to maintain his lane, following too close to the vehicles in front of it, and committed several improper lane changes," while traveling eastbound on Sunrise Boulevard. The vehicle came to a stop in the left northbound turn lane at the red light at Andrews Avenue and Sunrise Boulevard. Officer Wells activated his police vehicle's emergency lights to initiate a traffic stop, the Mercedes made a sharp right turn striking the vehicle in front of it. The Mercedes then continued east on Sunrise Boulevard striking two additional vehicles. Officer Wells noted the Mercedes did not stop and continued east on Sunrise Boulevard striking a curb and crashing into a tree at 200 East Sunrise Boulevard.

Officer Wells observed the driver of the Mercedes, John Barnes, exit through the driver door and flee. Officer Wells gave chase on foot. Despite verbal commands, Mr. Barnes continued running through the Bentley Auto Dealership. Officer Wells intercepted Mr. Barnes on the eastside of the dealership. He placed Mr. Barnes on the ground and ordered him to place his hands behind his back; however, he did not comply and refused to place his right hand behind his back. Officer Wells delivered a "closed fist strike" to the small of Mr. Barnes back enabling him to gain control of Mr. Barnes and place him into custody.

Officer Wells' report indicated Officer Zachary Baro responded to the address of the registered owner of the Mercedes and learned the vehicle had been stolen earlier in the day. Officer Arena completed the auto theft report relative to the theft of the Mercedes.

Upon learning the Mercedes had been taken in a theft, Officer Wells conducted a post-Miranda interview of Mr. Barnes. Officer Wells noted Mr. Barnes relayed to him he burglarized the Mercedes on his way home from school. Mr. Barnes located a key under the driver's seat, started the vehicle, and then drove towards Sunland Park. Mr. Barnes also relayed he fled the traffic stop as he was aware the vehicle was stolen and feared going to jail. Officer Wells report advised passenger of the Mercedes, provided a post-Miranda statement. During the statement, confirmed Mr. Barnes had informed the vehicle was stolen. Officer Wells also noted Sergeant Siekierski was apprised of the situation and responded to the scene.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplement Report OR#14-239794, authored by Officer Jan Caldera was reviewed. According to Officer Caldera's narrative, he responded to Officer Wells' request for assistance at 200 East Sunrise Boulevard. Officer Caldera immediately responded to the scene and observed Officer Wells taking Mr. Barnes into custody. Mr. Barnes was secured in the passenger compartment of Officer Caldera's marked unit when he made unsolicited statements implicating himself in the crime. Mr. Barnes offered to show Officer Caldera where he had discarded the vehicle owner's property. Mr. Barnes directed Officer Caldera to the 500 block of NW 2 Avenue where Officer Caldera recovered and photographed Mr. Ehring's wallet and sunglasses. The items were collected and returned to Mr. Ehring.

Florida Traffic Crash Report OR# 14-239814 completed by Public Safety Aide (PSA) Joseph Polan was reviewed. According to PSA Polan's narrative, Officer Wells advised via police radio of a "hit and run vehicle crash and subsequent bailout" at 6:55 PM on October 9, 2014. Upon his arrival he observed three damaged vehicles in the eastbound through lanes of Sunrise Boulevard. He then made contact with Officer Wells who informed him the suspect vehicle had been driving in an "erratic manner" eastbound on Sunrise Boulevard toward Andrews Avenue. Officer Wells then advised PSA Polan as he attempted a traffic stop, the suspect vehicle "made an erratic lane change from the left turn lane" and subsequently struck three vehicles. PSA Polan noted the suspect vehicle fled the accident scene at a high rate of speed and left the roadway striking a raised curb. Upon coming to rest in a ditch, the vehicle occupants fled on foot. PSA Polan documented the suspect, Mr. Barnes was charged with "RECKLESS DRIVING, NO DL AT ALL, LEAVE SCENE W/INJ, LEAVE SCENE PROP DAMAGE, and HIT/RUN AFTER LEO ORDERS TO STOP CAUSING INJ/DAMAGE."

PSA Polan's report indicated Officer Alvarez obtained a recorded statement from the suspect vehicle passenger, which was uploaded into the Foray System.

Statement was retrieved from the Foray System and reviewed. provided Officer Alvarez a sworn post-Miranda statement on October 9, 2014 at 8:09 PM. According to

Mr. Barnes offered in a ride home while was at a bus stop in the vicinity of Lincoln Park (1721 NW 6 Street). Indicated Mr. Barnes was driving a white Mercedes and proceeded to take home. Mr. Barnes inquired if the police were behind him, and informed him "yes." Mr. Barnes swerved out of the turn lane and struck another vehicle. The advised despite requests to stop, Mr. Barnes continued to drive away until they crashed and ended up in a ditch. The mercedes was stolen. "Stolo" is common street vernacular for a stolen vehicle. The sequence of events as delineated by lent credence to Officer Wells' written account of the event rather than the hyperbole he communicated to Officers Holding and Alvarez via text message.

On November 7, 2014, the Office of Internal Affairs contacted the Department's red light camera provider, American Traffic Solutions Inc., and requested traffic camera video footage for the intersection of West Sunrise Boulevard and NW 15 Avenue. The time frame requested was 6:45 PM to 7:05 PM for the date of October 9, 2014.

On November 18, 2014, Client Support Specialist Gladys Hola, provided the requested video footage. Due to software incompatibilities, the footage was unable to be viewed as provided. At the request of

Ms. Hola, PSA Maggie Bain, assigned to the Fort Lauderdale Police Department's Red Light Camera Enforcement Unit, downloaded the video footage to a DVD. The DVD was forwarded to the Office of Internal Affairs and reviewed. A review of the video failed to reveal any footage consistent with a police vehicle attempting to overtake, follow, or pursue a white Mercedes Benz E350.

On November 25, 2014, the "Fleeing Vehicle Review" relative to the arrest of Mr. Barnes was reviewed. The document was completed by Officer Wells' supervisor, Sergeant Michael Siekierski. According to Sergeant Siekierski's review of the matter, the fleeing vehicle incident initiated at 6:55 PM at West Sunrise Boulevard and North Andrews Avenue, then terminated at 6:56 PM at Sunrise Boulevard and Northeast 2 Avenue. Sergeant Siekierski noted Officer Wells observed a white Mercedes commit several traffic infractions while travelling eastbound on West Sunrise Boulevard. Officer Wells attempted to conduct a traffic stop at Sunrise Boulevard and North Andrews Avenue. Upon activating the emergency lights of his police vehicle, the Mercedes struck a vehicle in the eastbound left turn lane and continued striking two additional vehicles. Sergeant Siekierski indicated Officer Wells transmitted via police radio of a hit and run accident and he was not involved in the accident. He then advised, "they are bailing out", and after a brief foot pursuit apprehended the driver of the Mercedes.

Sergeant Siekierski's review documented the Mercedes theft had gone unreported prior to Officer Wells' attempted traffic stop. The driver failed to stop for Officer Wells and continued approximately two blocks prior to coming to its final resting point at 200 East Sunrise Boulevard. Sergeant Siekierski's review concluded Officer Wells' encounter with the stolen Mercedes was conducted within the Department's Policies and Procedures and no unauthorized vehicle pursuit occurred.

The "Trackstar" program was utilized to review the Automated Vehicle Locater (AVL) data for Officer Wells' assigned police vehicle 9591, for the date of October 9, 2014. Officer Wells' course of travel prior to the arrest of Mr. Barnes was reviewed. Sergeant Siekierski noted in his "Fleeing Vehicle Review," Officer Wells initially observed the white Mercedes traveling eastbound on West Sunrise Boulevard; therefore, information relative to his travel on West Sunrise Boulevard was closely analyzed. At 6:49 PM Officer Wells' police vehicle proceeded eastbound on West Sunrise Boulevard from NW 27 Avenue. His vehicle remained stationary for approximately one minute. Officer Wells continued to travel eastbound on West Sunrise Boulevard until deviating momentarily southbound towards the 900 block of NW 16 Avenue at 6:51:54 PM at 19 MPH. He then returned northbound on NW 16 Avenue at 6:52:09 PM at 11 MPH. Officer Wells entered onto the eastbound lanes of West Sunrise Boulevard at 6 MPH at 6:52:24 PM. Officer Wells continued his eastbound course at speeds ranging from 50 MPH to 9 MPH, likely to accommodate traffic congestion. Upon nearing the intersection of West Sunrise Boulevard and Andrews Avenue, Officer Wells slows to 15 MPH at 6:55:03 PM. His next reported course of travel is eastbound on East Sunrise Boulevard at 6:55:18 PM at 44 MPH. His subsequent location is stationary in the 900 block of NE 2 Avenue where he remained as such until 8:31 PM.

The review of the AVL report revealed it was consistent with Officer Wells' written account of the arrest of Mr. Barnes as well as Sergeant Siekierski's "Fleeing Vehicle Review" concluding the incident was conducted within the guidelines set forth in the Fort Lauderdale Police Department's Policy.

The Transactional Archived Report (TAR) for Officer Wells' queries on October 9, 2014 of the NCIC/FCIC database was provided by Department Terminal Access Coordinator, Detective Karl

Maracotta. A review of the document revealed, Officer Wells queried the Florida tag (Maracotta tag) of the Mercedes at 6:53:49 PM. Officer Wells' query revealed "NO NCIC WANT" for NCIC and "NO RECORD FOUND" for FCIC. The query of the tag included the corresponding vehicle and owner information.

The AVL report placed Officer Wells' police vehicle at the 600 block of West Sunrise Boulevard at exactly 6:53:49 PM, which indicated Officer Wells had no knowledge the vehicle was stolen prior to attempting to initiate a traffic stop, further substantiating his written account of the event was accurate.

The dispatch recordings relevant to the incident were reviewed. Officer Wells transmitted in a composed tone of voice "I just had a signal 3, I'm not involved white Mercedes," followed by "they're bailing out." Officer Wells then advised "200 block of East Sunrise black male eastbound," indicating he was in foot pursuit of the male. The dispatcher then initiated an alert tone on all Fort Lauderdale Police Communication channels and relayed Officer Wells observed a hit and run accident and the subjects had bailed out of a vehicle and fled in the 200 block of East Sunrise Boulevard. Her transmission concluded at 6:55 PM. Officer Wells apparently attempted to contact dispatch; however, Officer Wells instructing Mr. Barnes to "stop resisting!" was transmitted. Dispatch re-established contact with Officer Wells, and he advised he was attempting to place the subject in custody. Officer Wells then advised another unit had arrived to assist him and requested a unit secure the abandoned Mercedes. Officer Wells then advised a female passenger was at large, in response, a police perimeter was established. Officer Wells then confirmed he had the driver detained and provided a description for the female who fled the scene. Officer Wells also requested units respond to the registered owner's business to ascertain the status of the Mercedes. The dispatcher advised there was a call holding in District 1 regarding a white Mercedes E350. This further substantiated Officer Wells had no knowledge of the vehicle theft prior to initiating the traffic stop as a report regarding of the theft had not been generated nor had the tag been entered in the FCIC/NCIC database as pertaining to a stolen vehicle.

On November 25, 2014, Sergeant Bunin and Officer Shushman provided the Office of Internal Affairs sworn statements. Sergeant Bunin relayed he had been informed by Officer Shushman she had been contacted by Ms. Perez days prior to Officer Alvarez being relieved of duty. In turn, Sergeant Bunin notified the Office of Internal Affairs of his conversation with Officer Shushman.

During her interview, Officer Shushman indicated Ms. Perez called her cellular phone multiple times. Officer Shushman indicated Ms. Perez contacted her via cellular phone approximately one year ago and requested she cease calling and texting Officer Alvarez. Ms. Perez again contacted Officer Shushman days prior to Officer Alvarez being relieved of duty and insisted she discontinue calling and texting Officer Alvarez. In turn, Officer Shushman informed Ms. Perez she wanted nothing to do with Officer Alvarez and instructed Ms. Perez to stop calling her.

Based on further analysis of evidence in this matter, Officers Sousa and Holding were relieved from duty. On November 20, 2014, Officer Christopher Sousa was taken off restricted duty and was relieved from duty. On December 8, 2014, after returning from vacation, Officer Holding was taken off restricted duty and was relieved from duty.

On December 11, 2014, interviews of the police personnel listed in the credit section of "The Hoods" iMovie were initiated. Officers Cabrera and Schrider provided sworn and digitally recorded statements.

Both officers denied any involvement in the production of "The Hoods" iMovie and stressed never having viewed the video. They also confirmed they did not provide any of the materials or images contained in the iMovie.

On December 12, 2014, Detective Shields provided a sworn and digitally recorded statement. Detective Shields denied any involvement in the production of Officer Alvarez's iMovie. The iMovie contained benign photographs of both Detectives Shields and Graul; however, Detective Shields emphasized he did not provide them to Officer Alvarez.

On December 15, 2014, Detective John Graul provided a sworn and digitally recorded statement. Detective Graul advised he was sent the "The Hoods" iMovie via text message by Officer Alvarez. Due to the incompatibility with his phone, he was only able to view a portion of the iMovie. However, Detective Graul emphasized he immediately called Officer Alvarez to express his disapproval of what he had viewed. Detective Graul maintained he did not provide Officer Alvarez any of the materials or images contained in the iMovie.

On December 17, 2014, Sergeant Cristafaro provided a sworn and digitally recorded statement regarding a photograph of him and Officer Cabrera engaged in K-9 training, which was included in a text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Sergeant Cristafaro denied providing the image to Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Sergeant Cristafaro confirmed the image appeared to be a picture of a photograph displayed in the K-9 office.

On December 21, 2014, Officers Walters and Taylor II provided sworn and digitally recorded statements regarding their being mentioned in the text message conversations amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officer Walters had no insight as to why he was a topic of discussion for Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding, nor did he recall being involved in any recent calls for service with the aforementioned officers. Officer Walters confirmed he did not provide Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding any racially suggestive materials, nor did he receive any racially charged communications from Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding.

During his interview, Officer Taylor II recalled only interacting with Officer Alvarez on two occasions. One occasion was on the phone seeking information about a critical incident, and the other was a face to face conversation at the Hess Gas Station on Southeast 17 Street. Officer Taylor II recalled discussing Mr. Alton Nolen's crime in Oklahoma City with Officer Alvarez, but their discussion did not include the racially insensitive terms Officer Alvarez expressed in his text message to Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Taylor II indicated he did not believe he had any of the accused officers' phone numbers therefore did not engage in text message conversations with them. Officer Taylor II emphasized he only knew Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding in passing and was not privy to any conversations advocating violence against African Americans nor did he provide them any subversive images or materials.

Although originally ordered to provide his statement on the matter on January 22, 2015, Officer Alvarez tendered his resignation from employment with the City of Fort Lauderdale Police Department on January 21, 2015. Officer Alvarez was no longer under the purview of the Office of Internal Affairs and could not be compelled to provide a statement on the matter.

On January 23, 2015, Officers Sousa and Wells responded to the Office of Internal Affairs and were issued written notices for their respective follow up appointments. During their individual appointments, Officers Wells and Sousa were afforded the opportunity to review transcriptions of additional statements taken in the matter. Upon review of the additional statements, both officers declined to provide voluntary supplement statements to their original statements to the Office of Internal Affairs.

The Office of Internal Affairs was tasked with determining whether Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa's reported communications rose to the level of a policy violation of the Fort Lauderdale Police Department's Policy and Procedures.

The investigation into the matter led to statements being obtained from the following individuals noted below.

#### **STATEMENTS**

#### Complainant Priscilla Perez

On October 17, 2014, Ms. Priscilla Perez provided Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes a sworn and digitally recorded statement. Ms. Perez said she was engaged to be married to Officer Alvarez, until their relationship terminated on October 13, 2014. According to Ms. Perez on October 12, 2014, she took several screenshots of text message conversations between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Ms. Perez relayed the contents of the images as the following:

"The images were retrieved from Officer (Alex)'- um, (Alvarez)' phone. Um, there is snapshots of the pictures of the text messages, uh, so they're just pictures of the text messages of his conversation with several other officers, um, as well as a video that he created on his cell phone with images that he collected from scenes and from other police officers. Um, the reason that I sent it was I always wanted to send them. I knew it was something wrong that was occurring and actions that he was proceeding to do but I was just afraid for my life that if I would bring it up to you guys, um, our relationship would end and he would threaten to hurt me." (Page 2 Line 63-71).

Ms. Perez stated during their ten-month relationship, they shared their cellular phone passwords with each other. She also indicated they would conduct a "phone sweep" of each other's phones on a daily basis to ensure they were "behaving right, not cheating." Ms. Perez relayed it was during her "phone sweep" of Officer Alvarez's phone when she became of the aware images and text message conversations. Ms. Perez advised she scrolled through the text message conversations and "snap shotted" them. Ms. Perez articulated her purpose for memorializing the text message conversations as the following:

"Because - 'cause I alw- I - I was - it was just crazy to me the way that they're referring to - to those people and then to the black people and the name calling, and how they said, "Oh, what I'm gonna do on my day off is," like, "I'll drink nigger blood," and how they were obsessed, like - well, I'm talking about Officer (Alvarez). Of course, the

conversation flows with the other officers but all this was obtained from (Alvarez) phone." (Page 9 Lines 374-379).

Ms. Perez affirmed she sent the screenshots directly from Officer Alvarez's iPhone to her mother's iPhone. She emphasized she could not send the images to her own phone, for fear Officer Alvarez may find them. Ms. Perez indicated she then deleted the screenshots, as well as the "recently deleted" items from Officer Alvarez's iPhone, to ensure her subterfuge would go undetected.

Ms. Perez indicated she emailed the images from her mother's phone to a fictitious email address of <a href="mailto:hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com">hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com</a> to forward the screenshots to Police Chief Franklin C. Adderley. Ms. Perez affirmed she did not alter or manipulate the images in any way, nor did she provide the images as retribution for the break up with Officer Alvarez. Ms. Perez confirmed during her statement she had signed an electronic media consent form indicating her consent to retrieve the information from the iPhone she furnished the Office of Internal Affairs. She also acknowledged her mother was aware and approved of the information retrieval.

During the interview, it was brought to Ms. Perez's attention some of the images listed phone numbers rather than the names of the recipients of the text messages. Ms. Perez replied she had done so purposefully and deleted contacts from Officer Alvarez's iPhone. Ms. Perez explained her rationale below:

"Because - I did that on purpose. Once I obtained his phone, I deleted the contact 'cause they're not - you're just gonna see, um, (James Wells) or, um, (Jason Holding), okay? I - you could put anybody's phone number under that name. I wanted to make sure that you guys saw the phone number and you could see it on file that's oh, this is the phone number pertaining to this person. What good is it just seeing the name if you don't know what number is behind it. So I deleted the contact, made sure the phone numbers were visible and then I added the contacts back to his phone." (Page 9 Lines 402-409).

Regarding the video created by Officer Alvarez, Ms. Perez indicated he had utilized an iMovie application included in an Apple software update of "iOS 8" for the iPhone. Ms. Perez explained once downloaded to the iPhone, the user could produce movies utilizing pictures and videos from their phones as well as include standardized music. Ms. Perez described the contents of the video produced by Officer Alvarez as the following:

"Well, he created the video. He refers to himself and his friends as Uncle AI and makes signs (Alex Alvarez). Um, he included pictures of, like, President Obama and how he thought he would change everything. He says "Oh, one nigger." And you can see that he put, like, curls on him or what- whatever. He, um - he said that the niggers - the - 'cause he works the hood - would call him, um, the savage ha- uh, hunters 'cause they're savages, that they do- they don't act like human beings, that they're animals, that they shouldn't be treated like people because they're animals and - what else in the video." (Page 11 Lines 475-482).

#### She further stated:

"Oh, and he says, like, uh, i- in Kansas, like, it's okay that they - that they were, like, hurting, like, black people and he says that's how it should be. Like, a lot of references. I mean, there's a lot of images that - you know, I had the phone right here I could refresh my mind..." (Page 11 Lines 490-493).

Ms. Perez emphasized incidents which had occurred in Fort Lauderdale were supposedly depicted in the video produced by Officer Alex Alvarez. Ms. Perez advised, regarding a picture of a bloody crime scene, Officer Alvarez relayed to her, "a nigger did – he went through the m- um, window and cut himself and there was blood everywhere." She also advised a photograph of Officer Holding's crashed marked unit and Officer Pedro Cabrera's marked unit were also included in the video.

At the conclusion of the video, there was a credit section listing additional Fort Lauderdale Police Officers. Ms. Perez expressed Officer Alvarez relayed to her he thought that it would be funny to include people he talked to. According to Ms. Perez, he sent it to "most" of the officers listed in the credits. While some officers allegedly contacted him to express how "funny" they found the video, Detective John Graul called Officer Alvarez to express his disapproval.

Ms. Perez alleged Officer Alvarez had sent her other videos. She detailed the videos below:

"He sent them to me. It was like a black person in the middle of the street, like, drunk I think and he - they're, like, kicking him around and they were, like, asking him, like, funny questions and the guy was, like, crying in back of the police officer, um, vehicle. Things like that." (Page 13 Lines 566-569).

She further stated regarding the additional videos:

"I mean, there was like - I - and the one on the floor, the one in back of the car and then there was one that - that was, like, in the backyard, that they broke in and they found them sleeping in - in the back. It was a black person. So I think, like, three videos and - within the last four months. I can't - I - and I - I would be telling you, I'm lying. I don't know." (Page 13 Lines 577-581).

Ms. Perez claimed Officer Alvarez sent the videos to her; however, she was not in possession of said videos as she had changed phones.

During the course of Ms. Perez's interview, the screenshots she provided were discussed. Noted during the review with Ms. Perez were multiple references to the movie "Django Unchained." Ms. Perez stressed Officer Alvarez was fascinated by the feature film "Django Unchained" and referred to himself as Master Candie, the role of a slave owner played by Leonardo DiCaprio. She relayed Officer Alvarez believed "black people should be slaves." She further stated he was obsessed with the "KKK" and would call a number to listen to "jokes" or a "white power message." Ms. Perez also advised Officer Alvarez refused to watch the new release of the movie "Annie" due to the main characters being played by black actors and refused to eat at restaurants where black patrons were present. Ms. Perez pointed

out a screen shot, which included a picture of cow utters with the caption "Darren's nipples." She insisted the image was a "disrespectful" reference to a female police officer. She also expressed intimate knowledge of a call for service Officer Alvarez had handled, which resulted in him "getting in trouble" as well as alleged disparity in his enforcement of the law. Ms. Perez confirmed she was not present with Officer Alvarez during the incidents; however, he relayed the information to her as follows:

"I just - for the - I don't know, for the r- for the racism to stop, for the name calling to stop, to make sure that everyone's getting equal treatment. I know that, um, every time he would stop a white person that would be, like, uh, be on the phone or, like, texting, he was like, "Oh, I just stopped a white person and I let them go." If you guys could pull up the - his arrest, most of them are black and not all of them. Um, I just think it's very unfair. And he would go to, like, uh, a child abuse case and it was like a black person, he wouldn't pay much attention. He's like, "Oh, it's just another nigger. They're savages. It doesn't matter." He even had an incident that he got in - he got in trouble because he went to a child abuse case and he didn't file a report. He didn't - he didn't do what he was supposed to do and then another police officer went at midnight and they made an arrest, and he got in trouble for that because he - he doesn't pay attention to them. He doesn't feel that they deserve the same opportunities that white people do." (Page 17 Lines 759-772).

Ms. Perez confirmed she was unaware of any other acts of impropriety Officer Alvarez or other officers may have been involved in.

Ms. Perez presented the Office of Internal Affairs a Domestic Violence Pamphlet from the Miami-Dade Police Department. The pamphlet noted the date of offense as October 13, 2014, the responding officers were Officers M. Tirado (ID# 4472) and J. Perez (ID# 7356), and the police case number assigned as PD141013373467.

Ms. Perez described the events which prompted her to contact the Miami-Dade Police Department as the following:

"Because Officer (Alvarez) got home. I told him that I wanted to end the relationship and he got very verbally abusive and aggressive, s- started throwing the doors, pushed me out of the way, um, screaming and got very violent. When I asked him to leave, he said he wasn't leaving anywhere. He started using cuss words like bitch, et cetera, and I called the police." (Page 3 Lines 120-124).

Ms. Perez indicated Officer Alvarez was in uniform when he arrived home and was insistent on wearing his police uniform to make contact with the responding Miami-Dade Police Officers. Ms. Perez described Officer Alvarez's interaction with the Miami-Dade Police Officers below:

"Um, they asked - I was waiting outside because I was afraid he was inside, like, going crazy and so I waited outside. Once they arrived, um, they asked me where he was and if he was armed. I told them yes that he was armed because he didn't wanna take off his uniform, his belt or anything and he's waiting inside. Um, they came in and he was

just standing there and they made him, um, take out his gun and his, um, weapons, his knives and stuff and then he just started acting like a completely different person. Saying, "You don't have to worry about me. I do this for a living. I know what this is," and so on and so forth." (Page 5 Lines 190-198).

Ms. Perez advised the Miami-Dade Police Officers asked Officer Alvarez to leave for the night and he complied. She relayed he gathered some belongings and left in his police car. The following day they permanently ended their relationship.

#### Witness Detective Raphael Fernandez (CCN# 1356)

On November 24, 2014, Detective Raphael Fernandez provided a compelled sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. On October 17, 2014, Detective Fernandez responded to the Office of Internal Affairs at the request of Sergeant Cortes. As the Department's Digital Forensic Examiner, Detective Fernandez and performed a "digital dump" of the iPhone 5, Ms. Perez brought to her interview.

Detective Fernandez recounted meeting with Ms. Perez on October 17, 2014, and surmised their meeting as:

"Yes, w- uh, when I first came here, uh, I know she wanted to speak to me. She wanted to ask me a couple questions. I met her, I explained to her who I was, what I was going to do and she asked me two or three questions. Um, and - and sh- and she understood and she gave me consent." (Page 4 Lines 167-170).

Detective Fernandez detailed the information download from the iPhone 5 as follows:

"In my first logical report I - I did the screen shots. Um, there were MOV files as well. It was a mo- it's a movie file. Um, I - I was able to extract that, um, I also separated a multi-media service, a MMS report which is just text message with attachments. I did that one as well. Um, and I also found a separate chats/MMS, uh, f- report as well. Th-the evidence is all the same, it's just redundancy and the reason I do that is to validate the information. So if you have a cell phone and you take a picture with a camera and you save that into your internal memory of the camera but then you decide to save it onto your SD card and then you sent it to someone else, uh, through a text message that's like - the picture's not gonna be in three to four different places. Um, so I like to show the redundancy of - of the same information being so if someone takes a picture or creates a movie within an app but then sends it someone else or saves it somewhere else it's gonna be in multiple places. It's just not gonna mo- cut it and paste it, it's gonna be in multiple places. So I like to take all of the information where it's found just to show that it's the same exact information and it kinda shows its historical movement throughout the phone." (Page 3 lines 96-111).

Detective Fernandez described the method Ms. Perez used to transfer the information from Officer Alvarez's iPhone to her mother's iPhone as:

"It was MMS but it was instant messenger, um, instant messenger only exists through Apple so from when one Apple phone to another most likely that's how, uh, the information was transported over." (Page 5 Lines 181-183).

Detective Fernandez indicated there are "spoofing apps" or "open source apps" which could have been utilized to manufacture the text messages; however, the apps are not authorized or sold through Apple. Detective Fernandez confirmed the iPhone Ms. Perez provided during her interview did not have the required software to be "jail broken" nor did he observe any open source or outside apps.

#### Witness Sergeant Todd Bunin (CCN# 1349)

On November 25, 2014, Sergeant Todd Bunin provided a compelled sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Brull. Sergeant Bunin notified the Office of Internal Affairs Officer Kimberley Shushman informed him Ms. Perez had repeatedly contacted her prior to Officers Alvarez and Wells being relieved of duty. Sergeant Bunin advised Officer Shushman did not relay any specific details about her conversations with Ms. Perez. Sergeant Bunin did specifically recall Officer Shushman informing him regarding Ms. Perez, "she's crazy."

#### Witness Officer Kimberley Shushman (CCN# 1822)

On November 25, 2014, Officer Kimberley Shushman provided a compelled sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Brull. According to Officer Shushman, three to four days prior to the accused officers being relieved of duty, she received a phone call from Ms. Perez. In turn, she consulted with Sergeant Bunin as to whether she should come forward with the information.

Officer Shushman advised Ms. Perez initially contacted her approximately one year ago. She received multiple calls to her cellular phone from a blocked number. She subsequently received a call she believed was from Officer Alvarez due to his name appearing on her phone screen. Officer Shushman advised she and Officer Alvarez were working the same district and believed he was contacting her for assistance. Officer Shushman relayed upon taking the call, Ms. Perez inquired if she knew "Alex Alvarez." Officer Shushman replied in the affirmative and explained they worked together. In turn, Ms. Perez informed she was Officer Alvarez's fianceé and requested Officer Shushman discontinue texting and calling Officer Alvarez. Officer Shushman relayed she explained to Ms. Perez she called and texted Officer Alvarez as she would any other coworker. Officer Shushman emphasized Ms. Perez became upset and ended the call by saying, "Quit calling and texting him." She also recalled she subsequently received multiple "Facebook" requests from a "girt" she believed may have been Ms. Perez, but was not positive if Ms. Perez was the source of the requests.

Officer Shushman recounted the most recent call she received from Ms. Perez days prior to Officer Alvarez being relieved of duty as the following:

"The next time was shortly before (Alex Alvarez) got relieved of duty. I don't know the exact date, but I would say like two or three days prior to that. It was the same thing like phone call after phone call from a blocked number and then it finally came up as his number. So I answered again and I was like, "Hello?" And it was her again. And, um, I said, "Do you," or I asked her I said, "What do you what this time," or something appar-I - I don't know exactly what I said and she's like, "Why are you fucking calling him and texting him," and the long and short of it I said, "Look, bitch, I don't what anything to do with who - your boyfriend, I don't know what issues you have going on but stop fucking calling me." Um, I said, "You're crazy, you blow up my phone all the time when y-whenever you think he's doing something wrong or not doing something wrong." I said, "Leave me the fuck alone." And I told her to "grow the fuck up" and I hung up on her." (Page 3 Lines 102-114).

Officer Shushman confirmed neither call from Ms. Perez was related to Officer Alvarez's work or the allegations against him. Officer Shushman was provided a screenshot obtained from the iPhone 5, Ms. Perez provided the Office of Internal Affairs. The screenshot (IMG# 1654) appeared to be of a phone number originating from Naples, Florida. She indicated the phone number corresponded to her cellular phone. Officer Shushman was also provided screenshot (IMG# 1652). The image depicted a text message exchange she reportedly had with Officer Alvarez. Officer Shushman was asked to contextualize the exchange. She indicated she did not know what Officer Alvarez was attempting to communicate, which is why she replied "what the fuck are you talking about?"

Officer Shushman advised she did not receive any racially charged text messages from Officer Alvarez and their communication and relationship was professional in nature.

#### Witness Officer Pedro Cabrera (CCN # 1121)

On December 11, 2014, Officer Pedro Cabrera provided a compelled digitally recorded sworn statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Cabrera viewed an "iMovie" titled "The Hoods" produced on Officer Alvarez's iPhone. The video contained racially charged images as well as photographs of police department employees, vehicles, and possible department K-9s.

Officer Cabrera was presented a screenshot of the credit section at the conclusion of the video listing him by nick name "Pete Cabrera" as the "production designer." He advised "This is the first time I've seen this," and had no involvement in the creation of the video nor did he provide any of the images contained in the video. Officer Cabrera's K-9 partner, "Cannon" was listed in the credit section as the "costume designer." Officer Cabrera expressed he believed it was a poor attempt at humor. Due to his experience as a police K-9 handler, Officer Cabrera opined the K-9 images depicted in the "The Hoods" video were likely retrieved from internet sources. He additionally indicated the breeds of the K-9s in the video were not consistent with the breed of K-9 utilized by the department for "apprehension work." Officer Cabrera was also presented with a screenshot from "The Hoods" video of marked unit 6839. Fort Lauderdale Police Fleet records indicated the vehicle had been assigned to him since May 12, 2014. Officer Cabrera maintained he did not provide any of the accused officers the photograph and explained the following observations of the photograph:

"Correct. But I-I believe this was taken before it was issued to me, 'cause it has no, uh, antennas, no hookups to the computer. So I believe it was maybe when it rolled into the lot, somebody took a picture of it. That's before I was assigned to the car." (Page 3 Lines 106-109).

Officer Cabrera was presented screenshot (IMG #1632) which depicted a text message thread between Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The image contained a photograph of Officer Cabrera and Sergeant Paul Cristafaro engaged in K-9 training. Due to the position of the photograph in the screenshot, the sender could not be determined. Officer Cabrera explained he did not provide the photograph to any of the accused officers, and the image appeared to be a copy of a photograph located in the K-9 training facility. Officer Cabrera estimated the actual photograph displayed in the K-9 training facility to be approximately four to five years old. Regarding the photo, Officer Cabrera explained the following:

"That's just, uh, a training scenario we had; and, uh, we took some pictures for our, uh, information and follow up just to see how the dog was, uh, apprehending the training sleeve." (Page 4 Line 163-165).

Officer Cabrera further explained the K-9 training depicted in the photograph was consistent with activities he would be called upon to perform during demonstrations for the public.

Officer Cabrera was presented screenshot (IMG #1625) which depicted a text message thread between Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. In the text message conversation, Officer Alvarez proposed he and Officers Wells and Holding should get multiple "bailouts and perimeters" so "Tank and Cannon" could be called out. An inquiry was made with Officer Cabrera if Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells were in an agreement with him to engage traffic enforcement which would necessitate him and his K-9 partner "Cannon" to be called out. Officer Cabrera expressed he did not know what the intentions of the message were, but he was not on call out status and the K-9 units to be called out are determined by the unit supervisor. He also confirmed there is no apprehension dog in the K-9 unit named "Tank." Officer Cabrera affirmed that he was unaware of any subversive or sanctioned unit within the department known as "The Hoods" or "The Savage Hunters."

## Witness Officer Vincent Schrider (CCN# 1353)

On December 11, 2014, Officer Vincent Schrider provided a compelled digitally recorded sworn statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Schrider viewed an "iMovie" titled "The Hoods" reportedly produced on Officer Alvarez's iPhone. The video contained racially offensive images of African Americans as well as photographs of police department employees, vehicles, and possible department K-9s.

Regarding the K-9s depicted in the video, Officer Schrider stated based on his experience as a Bomb Detection K-9 Handler, only one Malinois could possibly be a police department K-9. Officer Schrider was then presented a screenshot of the credit section from the conclusion of the video listing him by nick name "Vince Schrider" as the "director of photography." Officer Schrider advised he had no idea

how his name came to be attached to the video and took no part in its creation. Officer Schrider also relayed he did not provide any of the accused officers any of the photographs displayed in the video. He was unfamiliar with the organization called "Uncle Al Films" listed in the credit section. He acknowledged the entry "An Alex Alvarez film" in the credit section and knew of Alex Alvarez's employment as a police officer with the department. Officer Schrider emphasized he had not seen the video made by Officer Alvarez prior to reviewing it at the Office of Internal Affairs.

Officer Schrider was presented screenshot (IMG #1612) which depicted a photograph of actor Martin Wuttke portraying Adolph Hitler in the film "Inglorious Bastards" with the caption "Schrida" below it. The picture and caption appeared to have been sent by Officer Alvarez to Officers Holding, Wells, and Sousa. None of the aforementioned officers responded to the text message from Officer Alvarez. Officer Schrider expressed it was not a photograph of him nor did he provide the photograph to any of the accused officers.

#### Witness Detective Timothy Shields (CCN# 1308)

On December 12, 2014, Detective Timothy Shields provided a compelled digitally recorded sworn statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Detective Shields viewed an "iMovie" titled "The Hoods" produced on Officer Alvarez's iPhone. The video contained racially offensive images as well as photographs of police department employees, vehicles, and possible department K-9s.

According to Detective Shields, he did not provide any of the images contained in the video; however, he recognized "K-9 (Turon)" from a video clip of a dog being bathed. He advised he did not create that specific footage nor did he distribute it to any of the accused officers. Regarding a photograph of him in a comical pose contained in the video, he recalled posing for the photograph approximately three months prior to his interview; however, he emphatically denied distributing the photograph for the purpose of being included in the "iMovie" created by Officer Alvarez. Regarding a photograph of himself and Detective John Graul speaking with a citizen in the police department lobby, he advised he did not recall when the photograph was taken and confirmed he did not distribute said photograph.

Detective Shields was then presented a screenshot of the credit section from the conclusion of the "iMovie" listing him as "Casting by Tim Shields." Detective Shields asserted he did not cast anyone for Officer Alvarez's video, nor did he request his name be listed in the credit section. Additionally, Detective Shields relayed he has never been employed in the film industry. Detective Shields confirmed he had no knowledge of any groups subversive or sanctioned known as "The Hoods" or "Savage Hunters."

#### Witness Detective John Graul (CCN# 1348)

On December 15, 2014, Detective John Graul provided a compelled digitally recorded sworn statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Detective Graul viewed an "iMovie" titled "The Hoods" reportedly produced on Officer Alvarez's iPhone. The video contained

racially charged images as well as photographs of police department employees, vehicles, and possible department K-9s.

According to Detective Graul, he had previously viewed the "iMovie," as it had been sent to him via text message by Officer Alvarez. He advised he was unable to view the "iMovie" in its entirety due the format and technological limitations of his cellular phone but viewed enough to prompt him to contact Officer Alvarez. Detective Graul stated he contacted Officer Alvarez via cellular phone and conveyed his disapproval and insisted he cease distributing it. When posed with the question of how Ms. Perez would have knowledge of their phone conversation, Detective Graul speculated Officer Alvarez may have informed her as he has never met or spoken with Ms. Perez. Also included in the "iMovie," were photographs depicting Detective Graul hunting, he and Detective Shields in the police station lobby, and his face superimposed on a poster for "The Godfather" movie. Detective Graul relayed he shared deer hunting photos with his friends but was unaware how Officer Alvarez acquired the deer hunting photo. In regards to the remaining photographs of him, he maintained he did not furnish them for Officer Alvarez. He asserted he had no knowledge of any subversive or sanctioned groups known as "The Hoods" or "Savage Hunters" within the department. Detective Graul emphasized during his statement he had no involvement in the creation of the "iMovie," nor did he provide any materials depicted in Officer Alvarez's video.

#### Witness Sergeant Paul Cristafaro (CCN# 1193)

On December 17, 2014, Sergeant Paul Cristafaro provided a compelled digitally recorded sworn statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Sergeant Cristafaro was presented screenshot (IMG #1632) which depicted a text message thread between Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The image contained a photograph of Officer Cabrera and Sergeant Cristafaro engaged in K-9 training. Due to the position of the photograph in the screenshot, the sender could not be determined.

Sergeant Cristafaro explained what was occurring in the photograph as the following:

"Uh, we're just doin' some training and in this vide- or in this - not video in the, uh, photograph, um, you notice that I'm actually picking my dog up, uh, from behind and the story behind it is, um, when I first got K-9 (Dusty), um, he was very tail sensitive, you couldn't go near his tail, you couldn't near their - his - his rear flanks. So a lotta times, ya know, trainers will go, "Well just avoid those areas." But I felt that it would be - it would be good to just make him comfortable, get him comfortable through training to where, you know, you can touch every part of his body. So throughout any kinda demonstration or anything I'm gonna be doin' with the public, ya know, his tail can be touched, his legs can be touched, his feet can be touched. So I worked very hard to get to that point to where I could pick him up and I used to - I used to do it on occasion just to show off that, ya know, I've, uh, I've overcome that training obstacle with him and now I've made him comfortable and built up a trust with him." (Page 2 Lines 58-71).

Sergeant Cristafaro confirmed the actual photograph is displayed in the K-9 office and any department member having visited the office could have taken a picture of the photograph. Sergeant Cristafaro also

explained the training scenario depicted in the photograph was consistent with K-9 demonstrations performed for the public. He detailed the purpose of the demonstrations as the following:

"Yeah of course. Um, w- you know, we do numerous demonstrations for the public. Um, when we train the dogs we use training sleeves and - and training suits where the dogs g- ya know, the dog's trained to bite and hold. So another thing this depicts to the public is, ya know, the dog's not - he's not chattering, he's not like a street dog where he's gonna go from one limb to another. He's going to make contact a- on command and he's gonna hold. So regardless of what happens he's going to hold. He's not gonna chatter and you're gonna avoid biting somebody multiple times, um, ya know, there are a lot of variables going into it but that demonstrates to the public that this isn't just your average street dog who's gonna, ya know, when you see like a pit bull attack somebody on the news and they've got multiple bites all over their arms and legs and feet and everywhere else, ya know, this is just illustrates that the dog is trained to properly bite and hold." (Page 4 Lines 135-147).

Sergeant Cristafaro maintained he did not have any interactions with any of the accused officers outside of work and advised he did not have any of their phone numbers nor did he receive any text messages from any of them. He confirmed there is a K-9 named "Cannon" assigned to the apprehension K-9 unit, however there is no K-9 named "Tank."

#### Witness Officer Thomas Taylor II (CCN# 1796)

On December 21, 2014, Officer Thomas Taylor II provided a sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Taylor II was presented screenshot (IMG #1622) which depicted a text message thread between Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. In the screenshot, Officer Alvarez communicated he was in contact with "Taylor tha thuuuurd." In response, Officer Holding inquires "How bad does he hate em." Officer Alvarez replies, "We are talking about the Oklahoma nigger," followed by a quote referencing "Django Unchained," "Jimmy what would big dad do to that nigger." In addition, Officer Taylor II reviewed a news article from "The Epoch Times" published on September 26, 2014 reporting Alton Nolen (an African American male) was identified as the suspect in the beheading of a coworker in Oklahoma City, Oklahoma.

Officer Taylor II detailed an interaction with Officer Alvarez he believed was referenced in the text message conversation as follows:

"I've only talked to Mr. (Alvarez) I think twice. And once, ah, (Wells) was there, they had called me over to ask me about a an altercation that Officer (Fithean) had been involved in where he couldn't get backup in a hotel. This one, the only thing I could think of is he was working overtime and I saw him at the Hess on Southeast 17th. Um, it probably came up. I can tell you that those particular words weren't discussed between us. Um, I don't agree with it. I didn't -I - I mean, I'll tell anybody my opinion of how that went and they didn't consider it an act of terrorism, all that nonsense and how he killed her I - I have a problem with that. I'm glad the guy was there to put an end to it. Other than that there was nothing discussed about what I would like to do to anybody or I don't even

know that he said anything like that. Um, 'cause honestly I – I don't really remember having a – like a one on one conversation as far as the particulars to this. I can just tell you that's my view on that. Um, the only conversation I truly remember having with (Alvarez) he asked where I lived." (Page 2 Lines 72-86).

Officer Taylor II maintained he did not have any racially charged conversations with Officer Alvarez and declared the following:

"Um, could he have -I - normally if somebody starts saying stupid stuff I try to walk away. I - I don't want it - but, I don't recall him using that word. And I know I didn't." (Page 3 Lines 96-98).

Officer Taylor II confirmed he did not furnish any of the accused officers any subversive images or pictures of department personnel or equipment. He stressed he only knew Officers Holding, Wells, and Alvarez in passing and did not believe he had any of their phone numbers.

#### Witness Officer Sean Walters (CCN# 1836)

On December 21, 2014, Officer Sean Walters provided a sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Walters was presented screenshot (IMG# 1623) which depicted a text message thread between Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The screenshot included an exchange amongst Officers Holding, Alvarez and Wells regarding being superior to other officers due to their assignment to Fort Lauderdale Police District 2. The screenshot included comments such as, "I'm a hood snob, if you ain't a hood cop you ain't a cop." Along with "If u ain't district 2 u ain't shit bro." Amongst the exchange was also the entry "Walters isn't 26 though bro." The sender could not be determined due to the position of the entry in the screenshot.

Officer Walters was unable to contextualize the entry based on his review of (IMG# 1623). Officer Walters was advised the text message conversation likely occurred between late September 2014 to early October 2014. In turn, Officer Walters stated he could not recall working with any of the three mentioned officers during that timeframe.

Officer Walters confirmed he never received any racially charged text messages from any of the accused officers, nor did he provide the any subversive images or images related to police personnel or vehicles.

## Accused Officer Christopher Sousa (CCN# 1793)

On January 16, 2015, Officer Christopher Sousa provided a sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Sousa and his Fraternal Order of Police Representative, Sergeant Michael Tucker reviewed the extensive investigative packet. Officer Sousa acknowledged reviewing "The Hoods" video reportedly made by Officer Alvarez as part of the provided material. He advised he did not supply any of the images contained in the video including subversive images or of department resources. Officer Sousa's attention was directed to the credit section at the conclusion of video, which listed him by name "Music by Chris Sousa." Officer

Sousa indicated he had no knowledge as to why Officer Alvarez listed him and had no participation in the creation of the video. Officer Sousa confirmed he had no knowledge of any groups within the agency known as either "The Hoods" or the "Savage Hunters."

The interview then centered on the screenshots of text message conversations, obtained from Ms. Perez. Regarding (IMG# 1605), which appeared to be sent by Officer Sousa to Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. The image depicted a white male lying across a broken chair with the caption "Alex at the substation." Officer Sousa explained the context of his communication as the following:

"Uh, in this photograph, I meant is as, uh – as a joke. (Alex), uh, is normally tired, 'cause he works several hours of overtime consistently. So I found a picture on the internet of a guy just sleeping in a chair, and then I sent it to him as what he would be possibly doing at the sub-station." (Page 4 Lines 152-155).

Regarding (IMG# 1606) depicting a photograph of cow utters with the caption "Darren nipples," Officer Sousa explained the following:

"Uh, again, it's another – it was another joke. That wh- we were making. I believe someone else said, uh – referring to a guy we know, (Darren), who's very ti- very, very large, and he doesn't wear a shirt underneath, so you can see his nipples. Uh, at that. I sent a picture of a cow with udders was his nipples hanging out as another act of – trying to be a comedian." (Page 4 Lines 179-183).

The above mentioned communication appeared to have been sent by Officer Sousa to Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. He further explained Darren is an employee of "Westway Towing" who he's known him since his employment with the department. Officer Sousa described their relationship as jovial.

Regarding (IMG# 1607) depicting a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The conversation thread included a cutoff photo of the mouth of a Black male with gold teeth, followed by an entry by Officer Sousa "You better have some boston lagers." Officer Holding replies "Only if you call them bastan laaagas," followed by a picture from Officer Wells of a gutted deer and a hunter seated next to it. Officer Sousa advised "Sam Adams Boston Lager" is one of his favorite alcoholic beverages and believed he was likely "going out or going to a club." He believed Officer Holding's entry was intended to make light of his Massachusetts accent. He was unable to articulate the relevance of the pictures of the gutted dear or Black male with gold teeth.

Regarding (IMG# 1608) depicting a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The text message thread appears to be the precursor to (IMG# 1607). Officer Holding initiates the conversation with "Al and Donnie sitting in the sub in their whitie tighties." Officer Alvarez responds "I towed 7 cars ... Darren's nipples got wet." Officer Holding replies "There was a 14 pointer in VIP tonight," followed by the aforementioned photograph of the Black male with gold teeth.

Officer Sousa indicated Officer Alvarez's comment regarding "Darren's nipples" was a continuation of his photograph of cow utters. He could not contextualize Officer Holding's comment regarding Al and

Donnie in the substation. He also could not explain the relevance of the photograph of the Black male with gold teeth or Officer Holding's comment.

Regarding (IMG# 1609) which depicts a sample of the conversation and appears to be the precursor to (IMG# 1608), Officer Sousa indicated he would be in the commission, in turn Officer Wells replies "Fraaaaauuudddd." Officer Sousa advised the term fraud was "Just a joke."

(IMG# 1610) depicts a text message conversation between Officers Wells, Alvarez, Holding and Alvarez. The screen shot appears to be the precursor to (IMG# 1609) and does not contain any racially offensive materials.

(IMG# 1611) portrays a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, Alvarez and Sousa. The sample depicts a picture of a police department photograph of Captain Kevin Sheehan sent by Officer Sousa. Officer Alvarez then communicates "Jimmy I've got sensitive signal 14 call me." Officer Sousa explained he sent the photograph of Captain Sheehan due to their shared "Boston accent," and indicated others would joke about the similarities of their accents. Officer Sousa had no insight regarding Officer Alvarez request for Officer Wells to call him.

Officer Sousa was presented (IMG# 1612) which depicted a photograph of actor Martin Wuttke portraying Adolph Hitler in the film "Inglorious Bastards" with the caption "Schrida" below it. The photograph and caption appear to have been sent by Officer Alvarez to Officers Sousa, Wells and Holdings. None of the officers commented or replied to Officer Alvarez's communication. Officer Sousa was unable to explain the connotation of Officer Alvarez's communication.

Below Officer Alvarez's communication was followed by a text message from Officer Sousa sent at 2:58 A.M. stating "Holdings we are coming and drinking all your beer and killing niggers." Officer Sousa explained the context of his text message as the following:

"Uh, during that, uh - I sent it as a joking matter. I saw people were talking in – within the group, um. I sent it being as a joke. Something I never should said. Something I'm disappointed that I've ever – ever said. And I'm – when I saw everybody else was texting, I felt, you know, maybe it – the way I could possibly fit in is saying something along those lines. Ever since I sent it, I've always regret it, and it's something I, uh - I never should said in a joking matter, 'cause it's not a joke. Whatsoever." (Page 8 Lines 336-342).

When confronted with the time indicated in his text message of "Yesterday 2:58 AM, Officer Sousa advised his assigned shift normally ends at 10:00 P.M., however he advised worked off-duty details which conclude between 2:00 A.M. or 3:00 A.M. generally on Fridays and Saturdays." He also advised he tended to work off-duty details on Wednesday nights, if one became available. There was no date included in the screenshot; therefore his status at the time of the message could not be definitively determined. Officer Sousa was posed a question if (IMG# 1612) and the use of the word "nigger" was indicative of his sincere feelings towards African Americans. Officer Sousa proffered the following:

"No - not, uh, not at all whatsoever. I've been disappointed ever since I - I sent that. You know, since the third grade my best friend is an African-American. Um, in high school when his parents weren't really there for him, he moved in with me and we pretty much lived together throughout high school. We're always together - we talk all the time. We refer to each other as brothers pretty much 'cause we're always around one another. Every time I go up there, I see him. Every time he comes down I - we hang out, you know, that's why it hits home with me because it's very disappointing that I would ever say - some- something like this." (Page 15 Lines 653-661).

Officer Sousa asserted he did not work with Officers Alvarez, Holdings, and Wells very often as he was assigned to the "District One Neighborhood Action Team." He categorized his relationship with Officers Alvarez and Holding as limited to "work friends" however he expressed he is "good friends" with Officer Wells.

(IMG# 1613) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Wells, Holding, and Sousa. Officer Wells communicates "4 49 silents at schools." Officer Holding sends a photograph of World War II bomber planes dropping munitions, followed by "Alex, James, Chris, air campaign-total bombardment" and "On fou fife." Officer Sousa had no insight regarding Officer Holding's message, however relayed "fou fife" was word play on Officer Holding's call sign of "four-five."

(IMG# 1614) includes a photograph of Officer Holding in a police academy photograph followed by the caption "plus this guy." In response Officer Alvarez replied, "I think I've watched the video over 1345677864321 times." Officer Sousa did not appear to reply to Officer Holding or Alvarez's entries. He was unable to shed light on the context of the communication.

(IMG# 1615) depicts another text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa. The image depicts a narrative titled Nigger Winter, which included racially insensitive terms, followed by a photograph of a Black male on the ground with a white male standing over him with a firearm. The image was captioned, "Kansas where shootin a nigger is a sport." Both items were attributed to Officer Alvarez due to being situated on the right side of the screen, indicating he was the sender. Although cropped in the image, Officer Sousa's phone number appears below Officer Alvarez's racially offensive materials. Officer Sousa was posed with the question as to whether Officer Alvarez's images were indicative of the type of communication he would receive from Officer Alvarez. Officer Sousa advised the following:

"No. Uh, it's something I don't, uh, like to receive. Um, I'm totally against the whole racist thing. Jokes like that, it's – it's – it's – it's a severe, sensitive, uh, issue to me." (Page 10 Lines 415-417).

It was brought to Officer Sousa's attention he seemingly was not included in the remaining text message conversations between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Sousa believed he was likely excluded due to his infrequent responses.

Officer Sousa explained his rationale for not responding to the images below:

"Well, uh, since – since growing up, high school, throughout life, you know – on TV, social media, et cetera, you – we hear racial insensitive things all the time. I – my way to deal with it is I choose to ignore it. I don't pay any attention, pay any mind to it. Um, I never thought these guys would go out and do something to this magnitude. They were just joking around. So that's what – that's the way I took it as. So I just chose to ignore it." (Page 10 Lines 434-439).

Officer Sousa did not provide any insight regarding the remaining screenshots, which depicted text message conversations limited to only Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. However regarding (IMG# 1641 and IMG# 1642) which included the opening credits to "The Hoods" iMovie, Officer Sousa confirmed he had not received the video sent by Officer Alvarez. Furthermore, according to the screenshot of the text message exchange, only Officers Holding and Wells were listed as the recipients and Officer Alvarez sent the video on "Wed, Oct 1, 8:07 PM."

## Accused Officer James Wells (CCN# 1786)

On January 20, 2015, Officer James Wells provided a sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Cortes. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Wells and his Fraternal Order of Police Representative, Detective Paul Maniates reviewed the investigative packet. Officer Wells acknowledged he had reviewed "The Hoods" video made by Officer Alvarez, as part of the investigative packet.

According to Officer Wells, he did not provide Officer Alvarez any of the images contained in "The Hoods" video, nor did he request to be listed in the credit section as "Edited by James Wells." Officer Wells relayed the following regarding previously expressing his disapproval to Officer Alvarez:

"Uh, I've done it multiple times. I've — I've done it after he initially sent the video. I told him that I think this was — it was a bad idea. Um, you know, I know how things can go viral these days with all the social media outlets. Um, I said I think, uh, I know he was joking. I knew Alex wasn't serious in the things that he put on there and the comments that he made. But, um, you know, I know how sometimes from an outside view how things look. Um, and I said, "I think from an outside view, Alex, I think this could — this would look really bad." And I said, "On top of that, you know, you've put my name in there and other officers' names and pictures." Um, so I said to him multiple times and, uh, you know, even more so after this investigation started, you know. I — I, you know, I said hindsight's 20/20 obviously, but I said, "I think you made a really bad choice making that video, you know." (Page 30 Lines 1333-1344).

## He further stated the following:

"I said it almost immediately to him about the – the viral thing and I said, how, you know, it really being, you know, uh, 'cause I-I know that's not how Alex really is, you know. At least I would -I-I, you know, I hope that, you know, he's not really that way. And I said, uh, "You know, on top of the fact that it would make you look bad, it would make

everyone else in that video look bad, you know, the officers that, uh, pictures are in there, and the names are at the end, including my name." (Page 31 Lines 1350-1356).

The remainder of the interview then centered on the screenshots of text message conversations, obtained from Ms. Perez. Regarding (IMG# 1603) depicts a text message conversation solely between Officer Alvarez and Officer Wells. Officer Alvarez communicates "They are doing it to all the cars," in turn Officer Wells replies "Niggers." Officer Wells indicated he was unable to recall the context of the conversation as the image did not contain the text messages prior to Officer Alvarez's communication. He also attributed the term "Faggot" directed at Officer Alvarez as a joke.

(IMG# 1604) depicted text message conversation between Officers Alvarez and Wells. The first message dated "Mon, Sep 22, 1:39 PM," Officer Alvarez says, "I tried sending it as a normal video lmk if it goes through." Officer Wells replies with his personal email address. Officer Wells was unable to recall the context of the messages. (IMG# 1604) contained an additional text conversation between Officer Wells and Officer Alvarez dated "Tue, Sep, 23, 9:01 PM," Officer Wells sent a picture of a television screen with an unknown program on the screen. Officer Alvarez replied "Brother." Officer Wells explained the program on the television screen was called "Counting Cars," and they were making light of one of the persons featured in the show who frequently uses the word "brother."

(IMG# 1605) appeared to be sent by Officer Sousa to Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. The image depicted a white male lying across a broken chair, with the caption "Alex at the substation." Officer Wells indicated the photograph sent by Officer Sousa was a joke about Officer Alvarez being tired. Regarding the photograph sent by Officer Holding portraying a caricature of an African American male picking his nose, Officer Wells stated, "I don't know what Jay's trying to relay there, sir. No." (Page 5 line 205).

Regarding (IMG# 1606) depicting a photograph of cow utters with the caption "Darren nipples," Officer Wells expressed the following:

"After reading Officer Sousa's statement, I – I know it's a reference to a friend of mine and he's also a tow truck driver for Westway who has a contract with the city. Apparently Sousa says that I guess his nipples show through his T-shirts or something to that effect." (Page 5 Lines 213-216).

In the same screenshot Officer Wells responds "Holdings Lmfao" in turn Officer Holding replies "I will forever be holdings to sousas." Officer Wells' final entry in the screenshot is "Due to his poor Grammar like Cecil stone." Officer Wells affirmed he was "making a joke" about Officer Sousa and Sergeant Cecil Stone relaying, "maybe both of 'em have bad grammar."

Regarding (IMG# 1607) depicting a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The conversation thread included a cutoff photo of the mouth of a Black male with gold teeth, followed by an entry by Officer Sousa "You better have some boston lagers." Officer Holding replies "Only if you call them bastan laaagas," followed by a picture from Officer Wells of a gutted deer and a hunter seated next to it.

Officer Wells was unable to contextualize the screenshot alone. (IMG# 1607) was combined with (IMG# 1608) to provide Officer Wells a more in depth portrayal of the text message conversation. (IMG# 1608) depicted a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The text message thread appears to be the precursor to (IMG# 1607). Officer Holding initiates the conversation with "Al and Donnie sitting in the sub in their whitie tighties." Officer Alvarez responds "I towed 7 cars ... Darren's nipples got wet." Officer Holding replied "There was a 14 pointer in VIP tonight," followed by the aforementioned photograph of the Black male with gold teeth.

Officer Wells was unaware of what Officer Holding was attempting to communicate about "Al and Donnie" in the substation. He assumed Officer Alvarez's mention of "Darren's nipples" was an extension of the previous joke. Regarding Officer Holding's entry of "There was a 14 pointer in VIP tonight," followed by the photograph and the Black male with gold teeth, and his response of the picture of the gutted deer, her explained the following:

"Yeah, I may have him making a, um, an off-colored joke referring to the – to the 14 pointer. Uh, 14 pointer is, um, slang or a hunter's term for a – for a deer, large deer, a male deer." (Page 7 Lines 288-290).

Officer Wells maintained he did not believe there was a racial connotation behind the photograph Officer Holding included in the text message conversation.

(IMG# 1610) portrays a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, Alvarez and Sousa. Officer Wells initiates the conversation with the entry of "Is there a lot of rentals up there? I know the answer so don't lie." Officer Alvarez replies with picture of a television and the caption "10-6 substation." Officer Wells indicated there was no racial context in the conversation.

(IMG# 1611) portrays a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, Alvarez and Sousa. The sample depicts a photograph of a police department photograph of Captain Kevin Sheehan sent by Officer Sousa. Officer Alvarez then communicates "Jimmy I've got sensitive signal 14 call me." The context of the photo was addressed by Officer Sousa during his statement. Regarding Officer Alvarez's request to call him, he believed it may have occurred during Officer Alvarez's breakup with Ms. Perez, but was not completely sure.

(IMG# 1612) depicted a photograph of actor Martin Wuttke portraying Adolph Hitler in the film "Inglorious Bastards" with the caption "Schrida" below it. The photograph and caption appear to have been sent by Officer Alvarez to Officers Sousa, Wells and Holdings. Although none of the officers appeared to have acknowledged the message, Officer Wells explained the context of Officer Alvarez's entry as the following:

"We would commonly, um, uh, make jokes about an officer that works here, Vincent Shrider, um, that he had a very German-sounding name; and we would obviously, uh, make a joke about it and say it like Shrida, like, uh, with a German accent." (Page 8 Lines 358-361).

Officer Wells advised there was no subversive context behind the photograph and was merely a joke about Officer Schrider's "German-sounding name."

Alvarez's communication was followed by a text message from Officer Sousa sent at 2:58 AM stating "Holdings we are coming and drinking all your beer and killing niggers." Officer Wells emphasized he believed Officer Sousa's text message was a joke and further stated:

"Yes, sir. And if I may add to that, that if I sincerely thought that Officer Sousa was gonna kill anybody for that matter, white, black, uh, male or female, I would – I'd report it, um, to you know, whoever – whatever time of day, whatever he may be, I'd report it. You know, I wouldn't let that happen." (Page 9 Lines 388-391).

Regarding Officer Alvarez's text about YouTube, he could not recall what video Officer Alvarez was directing them to on YouTube. The link was obscured by the text message entry bar of the iPhone screen.

(IMG# 1613) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Wells, Holding, and Sousa. Officer Wells communicates "4 49 silents at schools." Officer Holding sends a photograph of World War II bomber planes dropping munitions, followed by "Alex, James, Chris, air campaign-total bombardment" and "On fou fife." Officer Wells explained the text conversation below:

"Yeah, we would, uh, commonly joke about, um, busting on each other or making fun of each other or razzing each other. Um, I don't remember exactly what we were, uh, joking with Jason Holding on that particular day or — or time, but he's making a, um, he's making a reference to that we're bombarding him with jokes or really getting — really getting to him. Because he also refers to on four-five which is his call sign." (Page 10 Lines 407-412).

(IMG# 1615) another text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa. The image depicts a narrative Nigger Winter which included racially offensive terms, followed by a photograph of a Black male on the ground with a white male standing over him with a firearm. The image was captioned, "Kansas where shootin a nigger is a sport." Both items were sent by Officer Alvarez. Officer Wells was unable to articulate context of the text messages from Officer Alvarez. He also advised the racially charged narrative and photograph did not reflect the entirety of the communications he and the other accused officers had with Officer Alvarez.

(IMG# 1616) was a screenshot of a text message preview screen and did not appear to have any information relevant to the allegations.

(IMG# 1617) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding and Wells. In the screenshot is an entry from Officer Alvarez stating "Jimmy what would big dad do to that nigger," and "get that nigger out from under that wagon." In response Officer Wells replies "And that nigger lover in the wagon" followed by picture of KKK members surrounding a wagon from the film "Django Unchained." Officer Wells explained the conversation as the following:

"That's direct quotes from the movie, um, "Django Unchained." Um, I don't know the context of that. I don't think there was anything, um, Alex was saying or I was re-, you

know, replying back to him that was hurtful. It was just, you know – I'll speak for myself. It was me quoting – replying to him in a quote from the movie that he had made a reference to prior – prior to my response." (Page 11 Lines 480-485).

Officer Wells confirmed the contents of the conversation were not directed at any members of the public or racial minorities.

(IMG# 1620) depicted a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez and Officer Kimberly Shushman. Officer Wells could not explain the context of the text messages. When posed with the question as to the nature of Officers Alvarez and Shushman's relationship, Officer Wells advised it appeared to him they had a "working relationship and that was it."

(IMG# 1621 and IMG# 1622) were combined to create a more sequential text message conversation. Depicted in the screenshots was a text message thread amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. The conversation is initiated by Officer Alvarez indicating he is in contact with Officer Thomas Taylor II. This is followed by the entry "How bad does he hate em," from Officer Holding. Officer Alvarez replied, "We are talking about the Oklahoma nigger," followed by "Jimmy what would big dad do to that nigger," and "Get that nigger out from under that wagon." Officer Wells replies to Officer Alvarez "And get that nigger lover in the wagon," including a picture from the film "Django Unchained" of men wearing white hoods surrounding a wagon.

Officer Wells explained his interpretation of the exchange as the following:

"I mean, he's talking about the Oklahoma guy, the terrorist who, uh, beheaded a coworker. Then he asks me, you know, what would he do. And then he makes a quote. He makes a reference to Django." (Page 13 Lines 550-553).

Officer Wells advised he did not perceive any subversive connotation in the conversation, nor did he perceive Officer Alvarez was advocating violence against Mr. Alton Nolen, whom beheaded his coworker in Oklahoma.

(IMG# 1623) appears to be a discussion about FLPD Officer Sean Walters, involving Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officer Wells was asked to contextualize the entry "Walters isn't 26 bro." Officers Wells indicated he was unable to explain the entry without the text messages precipitating the entry.

(IMG# 1624) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officers Alvarez and Holding exchanged messages criticizing their coworkers and officers assigned to the midnight shift. Officer Wells was asked to explain an entry made by Officer Alvarez stating "Might as well have been teddy Tim brown and Beltrani responding. These ppl are beyond low speed." Officer Wells responded "Fo fo." Officer Holding responded, "Lazy fucks, I couldn't even get a 105 last weekend." To which Alvarez responded, "Everyone on this midnight roster is a joke." Officer Wells indicated Officer Alvarez was referring Officers Theodore Levin, Timothy Ryan, Juanita T. Brown and Cristina Beltrani. Officer Wells identified both Officers Levin and Ryan as white males and Officer

Brown as a Black female and Officer Beltrani as white female. He indicated there was no racial context behind the message.

(IMG# 1625) is a screen shot of a text message exchange amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officer Wells initiated the conversation by stating "J can u get a bailout today pappey," in turn Officer Holding replies "Let the hunt begin." Officer Alvarez added, "J we each need bailouts today at the same time and multiple perimeters and cannon and tank to be called out."

Officer Wells explained his interpretation of the conversation below:

"I like to work when I'm at work, Sarge. I enjoy, uh, I think it makes the shift go by faster if you're out there, you know, taking calls or getting a bailout as I refer to in here or being corrective, making traffic stops, you know, doing that kind of corrective. Uh, to me it makes my shift go by faster. Um, so I would encour- uh, it looks like I'm encouraging them there to go out and do work. Um, I – I believe I ask them – I ask Jason Holding to get a bailout. Um, I think I speak for my part on there or, uh" (Page 16 Lines 691-697).

Officer Wells asserted he knew "Cannon" to be the K-9 assigned to Officer Cabrera, but was unaware of who "Tank" is. He confirmed he did not do anything, which would specifically cause Officer Cabrera to be called out. The last comment on this message from Officer Wells is "Retarded brown."

(IMG# 1626) depicts a text conversation between Officer Wells and Holding. Officer Alvarez was a recipient of the text messages, however did not appear to reply based on the screen shot provided by Ms. Perez. Officer Wells posed a question to Officer Holding "J what if one of the three cars that my sig 10 hit was your personal vehicle." Officer Holding replies "I'd have the noose ready," in turn Officer Wells advised "It would be your luck tho driving home from bingo and a 10 hits u." Officer Holding concluded the conversation by texting an Emoji face "and Shannon shows up and takes my license." Officer Wells explained the content of the conversation as the following:

"I said, "Jay, what if one of the three cars that my signal 10 hit was your personal vehicle?" It's an inside joke or an open joke now, I guess. Uh, Jason Holding notoriously had been in a lot of on-duty accidents. And we would also, um, joke around about the fact that he couldn't drive or the fact that he was, uh, involved in a lot of accidents at work." (Page 17 Lines 753-757).

(IMG# 1627) appeared to be the precursor to (IMG# 1626). Officer Alvarez does not appear to acknowledge the conversation between Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Wells communicates "It was off air until he hit 3 cars at Andrews and sunrise." Officer Holding replies "Stones already reviewing the rat on the roof." The conversation then melds with (IMG# 1626) when Officer Wells replies "J what if one of the three cars that my sig 10 hit was your personal vehicle."

Officer Wells confirmed the aforementioned reports and evidence accurately portrayed the events leading to the arrest of Mr. John Barnes and the recovery of the stolen Mercedes Benz, documented under OR# 14-239794. Officer Wells emphatically denied engaging in an unauthorized pursuit of the

Mercedes Benz, or failing to communicate via police radio of his involvement in a vehicle pursuit. Officer Wells explained his rationale for his text message below:

"It was just jokin'. It wasn't – obviously I wasn't serious about the car fleeing from me. I reviewed my AVL that day, and I know I was there and that car, I never chased that car. I was embellishing or telling a – a joke or a tall tale to the other guys." (Page 19 Lines 835-838).

(IMG# 1628) depicted a photograph of a white Mercedes Benz with front end damage, followed by the inquiry from Officer Holding, "Hot sheet?" Officer Wells replies, "No fresh 10 from dist 1," in turn Officer Holding remarks "Crazy Nigger" and "I love chasing off the grid." Officer Wells interpreted Officer Holding's remarks as the following:

"My interpretation would be that, I mean, he likes chasing cars, um, maybe off air or, uh, that – that'd be my conno- that – that'd be the best understanding of that." (Page 20 Lines 885-887).

Officer Wells further stated he had never known Officer Holding to ever engage in chasing cars "off air." Officer Wells did not elaborate on Officer Holding's entry of "Crazy Nigger."

(IMG# 1629) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Alvarez was a recipient of the text messages, however did not appear to reply. Officer Wells initiated the conversation with the entry "Papi I love bailouts," Officer Holding replied "In that co dade boy, You get another!?" Officer Wells in turn replied, "J ur boys in the vw bailed on me" and "Not the vw but a sig 10 mercedes. Nigger hit 3 cars and then crashed and bailed out." Officer Holding replies, "If that's true I'll kiss your ass, I want those niggers."

Officer Wells explained his interpretation of the conversation below:

"Uh, that was a Volkswagen that, uh, that Holding had been looking for. I don't know if it was a stolen vehicle or — I know he'd been looking for a Volkswagen. He had told us about it, and he gave us the tag. I don't recall off the top of my head now. Um, so mmy text to him was, you know, your boys in the Volkswagen bailed on me, just joking with him obviously. It's not — obviously it wasn't a Volkswagen and obviously it wasn't the car he was looking for. It was a joke." (Page 21 Lines 907-913).

Officer Wells was then asked to specifically explain his use of the word "nigger" in the text conversation. Officer Wells offered the following:

"I don't have an explanation for you, Sarge. Um, it was, uh, a word that, um, uh, looking back and — and taken out of context, you know, in this manner, it's — it's distasteful and it's, uh, unprofessional; and, um, an explanation for you, I do not have an explanation for you. It was distasteful." (Page 21 Lines 919-922).

Officer Wells further explained his use of the word "nigger" did not reflect his true feelings toward African Americans. When posed with the question as to whether he had used the term in jest or out of hate, Officer Wells replied, "Definitely not out of hate." (Page 22 Line 939). Officer Wells asserted the term "nigger," is not always used as a derogatory term and "sometimes it's almost meant as a, you know, an endearment or a friend or someone you're close with." (Page 22 Lines 960-961).

(IMG# 1630) depicts a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Holding makes an entry on "Thursday 4:28 AM" of "I bout killed a man on 2 st boys." Neither Officer Alvarez nor Officer Wells acknowledged the entry. On "Thursday 9:13 PM" Officer Wells communicated "Thanks bro," Officer Alvarez replied, "This faggot just said he's asthmatic and had an attack 2 days." Officer Wells in turn replied with Emoji pictures of six fists and a monkey. Officer Alvarez replied "Med clearance ... Jimmy I'm gonna s/5 him," followed by "With the boomerang."

Officer Wells explained the connotation of the Emoji pictures he sent to Officer Alvarez as the following:

"I think I'm just upset. I'm upset at, um, and maybe the monkey is referring to, uh, the arrestee. Um, occasionally, you know, we – we refer to, uh, you know, bad guys or, you know, career criminals as – as, um, as animals because, you know, they – they don't act right in society or something like that. So it may have been a reference to that. Um, I think nothing more than that." (Page 23 Lines 1011-1016).

Regarding Officer Alvarez's entry indicating "I'm gonna s/5 him", Officer Wells believed Officer Alvarez was referring to Mr. Barnes whom he arrested in the stolen Mercedes Benz on October 9, 2014. Officer Wells advised he did not believe Officer Alvarez sincerely was going to kill Mr. Barnes and would have immediately notified his chain of command if he perceived Officer Alvarez's text message to be sincere. He was unaware of the meaning behind Officer Alvarez's message of "With the boomerang."

(IMG# 1631) depicted a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez and Officer Holding. Officer Wells appears to be listed as a recipient of the conversation did not appear to participate. Officer Holding appears to express his frustration of his lack of romantic progress with a Cuban female. He specifically text, "Just a fucking make out session" and "Fucking cubanas". Officer Alvarez responds with "Pfttt that's a 98 bravo kid what happened." Holding retorted "The panty dropper had it's first fail" followed by "This chick was high class cuban, nada impressed her" and "Fucking cuban elite."

(IMG# 1632) depicted a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez, Officer Holding, and Officer Wells. The screenshot includes a photograph of Sergeant Paul Cristafaro and Officer Pedro Cabrera engaged in K-9 training. The sender of the photograph is not revealed in the screen shot, and none of the accused officers appear to comment on the photograph.

Officer Wells took responsibility for sending the photograph and explained he believed Officer Cabrera looked "funny in the picture."

(IMG# 1633) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Holding initiates the conversation "Got some strange 51 to the galt," followed by "I had a wet dream that you two found those two niggers in the VW and gave them the death penalty right there on

the spot." Officer Wells replies "J I was hunting for that car in dist 5 today" and "I would hurt them". Officer Alvarez replies "I was in district 6794 looking for it as well."

Officers Wells stressed he believed Officer Holding's statement about advocating the death penalty on two African Americans was made in jest. Officer Wells explained his comment in the text conversation as follows:

"I was looking for the vehicle, um, just through my travels. Um, if I remember right, Officer Holding had located it or first seen it in the District Five area which is unincorporated Fort Lauderdale. Um, and I would hurt them, at pla- you know, at first sound, it maybe sounds physical but, I mean, it could also be, you know, punitively, too, you know, uh, take 'em to jail or arrest 'em or whatever it may be." (Page 26 Lines 1118-1123).

(IMG# 1634) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Alvarez makes an entry of "Look at those Cobras bro." In response Officer Holding sends a picture of a pocket knife with the caption, "King cobras." Officer Wells was unaware what Officers Alvarez and Holding were discussing.

(IMG# 1635) contains a discussion amongst Officer Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officers Wells and Holding discuss training. Officer Alvarez sends them a picture of him and Officer Rolando Rivera giving a "thumbs up" hand gesture, while seated at a restaurant. Officer Wells indicated there was no subversive context behind the conversation.

(IMG# 1636) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Holding and Wells. Although it appears Officer Alvarez received the conversational texts, he did not participate in the portion captured in the screenshot. A link to a Sun Sentinel article about an armed robbery kidnapping followed by "That's probably who was in that VW." The sender is undetermined due to the position of the text in the screen shot, however the text is positioned on the left side of the screen indicating Officer Alvarez did not initiate the text. Officer Wells replied "Couple of goons," in turn Officer Holding communicates "Couple of armed jack boys papiiiiii" and "Shoot out at OK Coral," followed by a link to a YouTube video <a href="http://youtu.be/FRiWAxMMX50">http://youtu.be/FRiWAxMMX50</a>. The link led to a scene of a shootout from the film "Tombstone." Officer Wells stressed there was no hidden meaning or racial context behind the communication.

(IMG# 1637) depicts a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Holding is listed as a recipient, however did not appear to contribute to the conversation. Officer Alvarez initiated the conversation by sending a picture of himself making an odd facial gesture. Officer Wells replied "Damn kid. U look ready for off the grid." Officer Wells explained his text message as the following:

"It looks like he got a haircut and shaved; and it looks like he's ready to, you know, get off of work. I don't remember if he was still, uh, with (Priscilla Perez) at this time or not. But, you know, it looks like he was ready to, you know, go out for the weekend for..." (Page 27 Lines 1164-1167).

Officer Wells further explained the text message was not a reference to pursuing vehicles without advising via police radio. This is contrary to his previous explanation.

(IMG# 1638) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Wells did not appear to acknowledge the texts from Officers Holding and Alvarez. Officer Holding initiates the conversation with the entry "3412 ocean." Officer Alvarez responds "J.. Ol Jimmy Dean put tinfoil on his phone," followed by "He's dark" and an internet meme with a photograph of actors wearing tin foil hats on their heads. The photograph included the caption "Tin Foil – FREE YOUR MIND." Officer Holding replies "Yeah he's totally deep behind enemy lines."

Officer Wells explained the content of the conversation as the following:

"Uh, once again, um, we joked a lot. We made a lot of jokes, a lot of inside jokes. Um, one of the jokes that we would make is if in a group text message or even in a regular message if you weren't responding to us, we'd make a joke that you'd wrapped your phone in tinfoil, and that's why you weren't answering. So it sounds like they're referring to me, that I wasn't maybe not (unintelligible) the message, and I wasn't answering them, so it looks like Alex made a reference to that I had put tinfoil on my phone and that he's dark, which means he's not answering. He's not – he's not communicating with us." (Page 27 Lines 1189-1196).

(IMG# 1639) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Alvarez makes an entry of "Useless shits" and "Jimmy you got pizza? In response Officer Wells replies "Niggers everywhere." Officer Holding adds "Alex I grabbed you one to go." Officer Wells explained his use of the word "nigger" as the following:

"Um, it sounds like at first like we were goin' to get, you know, food or — or dinner at some point. Uh, my comment, though, I'll speak on about the N word everywhere. I—I don't know if that's, um, it's not meant to be, uh, you know, uh, offensive or anything like that. You know, it's — it's — I heard that in music, you know, hip hop music, rap music, R&B music. Um, I don't know if that song was on the radio at the time. I—I don't remember, sir." (Page 27 Lines 1205-1210).

(IMG #1640) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The image captured a portion of a text message from Officer Alvarez of "randy combined." In response Officer Wells replied with an Emoji picture of a ghost followed by "the hoods" and concluded again with an Emoji picture of a ghost. Officer Holding again replied "Torons a fellow mudshark." (Mudshark is a commonly known derogatory term to describe a white female who is involved in a relationship with an African American male). The remainder of the text conversation was work related. Officer Wells contextualized the conversation below:

"Uh, it's a reference to that, um, the movie that Alex had made that I had seen. Um, and I don't know why I responded that way. It's kinda hard to tell because the, you know, the text above it is, um, is cropped out. But I'm making a reference to that, you know, the —

a joke – I'm making a joke in reference to the – the movie Alex had made." (Page 28 Lines 1241-1245).

(IMG #1641) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The screenshot captured a portion of a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez and Officer Wells. The communication starts with an entry from Officer Alvarez of "Fo five," followed by a series of Emoji pictures of tearful smiling face from Officer Wells. The text conversation re-initiates on "Wed, Oct 1, 8:07 P.M." with the opening shot of "The Hoods" video sent by Officer Alvarez.

Officer Wells could not recollect the context of the conversation prior to Officer Alvarez's video. He confirmed he believed that was the date and time he received the video from Officer Alvarez.

(IMG #1642) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The screenshot appears to be a continuation of the prior screenshot (IMG# 1641). The text conversation initiates on "Wed, Oct 1, 8:07 P.M." with the opening shot of "The Hoods" video sent by Officer Alvarez. Officer Wells replied "10 8," followed by an entry of "It's all we have left" from Officer Holding. The question was posed to Officer Wells if he used the term "10 8" to communicate he was back in service or as an endorsement of the video. Officer Wells expressed he believed he was indicating he was back in service to his coworkers. He further explained the following:

"I'll take this time to comment on that video. I – I think that video was – was stupid. I mean, it was – it was, uh, stupid; and I was mad at Alex for using my name, put my name in the video, um, using pictures of me and my – my canine partner. Um, so I don't believe I was responding that "10-8" response to that video. I do not, sir." (Page 30 Lines 1320-1324).

Officer Wells confirmed he had not received any videos from Officer Alvarez portraying him kicking anyone or of an arrestee crying nor did he partake in the creation of the videos Ms. Perez alleged to have received from Officer Alvarez.

(IMG# 1643) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The conversation was cropped in the screenshot; therefore the sender could not be determined. However Officers Wells and Holding were listed as the recipients, therefore their communications are situated on the left side of the screen, eliminating Officer Alvarez as the source of the content. The screenshot included a cutoff text of "one," followed by "Down." Below the text was an image of a wanted poster for a Mr. Jesse Leroy Matthew Jr. (who was the suspect in a high profile abduction of a Virginia college student), followed by the entry "this nigger raped and killed four and raped." Officer Wells acknowledged being a recipient of the texts messages, however did not recall ever seeing contents of the screenshot.

(IMG# 1644) is dated "Sun, Sep 28, 4:27 PM," the screenshot depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Wells is listed as a recipient of the messages, but did not appear to join in the text conversation. Officer Holding sends a picture of two African American males riding a horse, followed by the caption of "Deadwood and randy riding bravo." On "Sun Sep 28, 9:01 PM," Officer Alvarez sends a picture of a white male holding a rifle with a white teenage female

looking at him. The picture appears to be from an internet source and is captioned "RULES FOR DATING MY DAUGHTER."

Officer Wells expressed his interpretation of the text messages as the following:

"Yeah, he's referring – by deadwood he's referring to, um, Officer (Lockwood), who, uh, who worked on our shift. He's, uh, was going over to the mounted. I believe now he might be in the mounted unit. At this time he was transferring over to the mounted unit. So it's just a reference to him probably being in the mounted unit." (Page 32 Lines 1401-1405).

Officer Wells assumed the reference to "randy" in Officer Holding's text message may be Officer Randy Washington. He did not interpret any racial content in the screenshot. He was asked to explain the reference "Deadwood" regarding Officer Henry Lockwood III. Officer Wells explained there was no racial connotation behind the nickname. Officer Wells emphasized, "Um, so we had, you know, jokingly instead of calling him (Lockwood), we'd call him Deadwood, because he wasn't – we felt that he wasn't pulling his weight on our shift." (Page 32 Lines 1429-1432). Officer Wells was unable to explain the meaning of the photograph Officer Alvarez had sent.

(IMG# 1645) is dated "Sun, Sep 28, 1:02 AM," the screenshot depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Wells is listed as a recipient but does not appear to acknowledge the message from Officer Holding. Officer Alvarez would have received the message according to the screenshot, however did not reply to the message from Officer Holding either. Officer Holding sends a picture of a white female posing with several Black males. The picture is captioned above "you know her dad is at home re-evaluating his life." Below the picture is a text message relaying "God please no daughters." Officer Wells had no knowledge if interracial dating or marriage was a topic of discussion that may have preceded Officer Holding's text nor did he know what message Officer Holding was attempting to convey.

(IMG# 1646) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The screenshot contains a cropped text message of "highest quality." The sender and complete content are not visible. Below the aforementioned text is an entry from Officer Wells of "He stole a role of it from Santa Barbara," followed by a screenshot of the opening credits of Officer Alvarez's "The Hoods" video. The image sent by Officer Wells garnered a response from Officer Alvarez as indicated by a green text message bubble. The content cannot be seen as the Officer Alvarez's text is obscured text message entry box of the iPhone. Officer Wells relayed he was not sure what he was replying to, but indicated Santa Barbara is a restaurant they would frequent for meal breaks.

(IMG# 1647) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Alvarez initiates the conversation with "There's a grudge going on right there." The conversation continues on "Sat, Sep 27, 8:34 PM" when Officer Wells sends a text message of "Watching Django right now," along with two Emoji pictures of two tearful smiling faces. In response Officer Alvarez replied, "It's a movie about Lockwood." In turn Officer Holding sent an internet screenshot from a

Google query which appeared to be of a man holding a lap dog. The cropped title of the image appeared to possibly be "dog watching tv side by side with man."

Officer Wells was unsure what correlation the image of the man with the dog sent by Officer Holding had to the conversation. He had no insight as to what Officer Alvarez was referring to with his text messages. He also theorized his text was likely a response to a previous text message and inserted into the conversation portrayed in the screenshot. He was unsure as he had switched phones and no longer utilized an iPhone.

(IMG# 1648) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. Officer Alvarez did not appear to contribute to the conversation. The screenshot starts with a grey text bubble, however the content and sender are obscured by the recipient box of the iPhone screen. Preceding the obscured text bubble is an image of Mr. Nolen with a narrative describing his crime. Preceding the image of Mr. Nolen is a text entry of "This nigger beheaded a lady today in Oklahoma." The sender or their phone number was not captured by the screenshot of the text conversation. Below the aforementioned communication appears Officer Holding's phone number and a grey text message bubble. Officer Holding's response was obscured by the text message entry box of the iPhone screen.

Officer Wells indicated he did not recall sending the content about Mr. Nolen. He indicated he could have sent it but could not confirm it due to screenshot obscuring the sender. Officer Wells agreed Officer Holding may have been the source of the image and text.

(IMG# 1650) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The conversation depicted in the screenshot starts with an image of a nuclear blast mushroom cloud, the sender appears to be Officer Alvarez as the image is situated on the right side of the screen. The text message continues on "Monday 6:52 PM" when Officer Holding sends a text of "Alana new nickname, the fat rat." This message was possibly referring to Officer Alana Ashley. On "Monday 9:14 PM" Officer Wells sent a photograph which was severely cropped and content could not be determined.

Officer Wells relayed he was not sure what Officer Holding was attempting to communicate with his text message.

(IMG# 1651) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Wells, Officer Holding, and Officer Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The screenshot appears to be a near duplicate of (IMG# 1637) however includes a text message from Officer Holding which was not relevant to the allegations.

(IMG# 1652) is a duplicate of (IMG# 1620) which depicted a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez and Officer Kimberly Shushman. Officer Wells previously addressed this item in his statement.

(IMG# 1653) appears to be a blank iPhone "Info" screen with no discernible content.

(IMG# 1654) appears to be an iPhone "Info" screen with Officer Shushman's phone number with an entry indicating "Outgoing Call" to Officer Shushman's phone number "Today at 9:01 AM" lasting one minute.

The remainder of the interview focused on his relationships with other accused officers and the complainant Ms. Perez. Officer Wells advised he was "work friends" with Officers Holding and Alvarez and never spent time with them outside of work. Conversely, Officer Wells indicated he and Officer Sousa are "pretty good friends," attended the police academy together and spend time together outside of work. Officer Wells stressed none of the accused officers in this matter were members of any hate groups such as the Ku Klux Klan.

When posed with the question if the accused officers would engage in the behavior described in the text messages and if the communications reflected their character and true feelings toward minorities, Officer Wells relayed the following:

"No, sir, I do not. I think, um, I think that it's all, you know, um, uh, distasteful jokes lookin' back on it. And, um, I think that, um, as police officers, you know, we — we deal with a lot of stress. And I think that, uh, one of the ways that, uh, we chose to relieve our stress was through comedy, uh, making each other laugh, um, getting a, you know, a — a rise out of the other one, just joking amongst ourselves in a private group text message. So, to answer your question, I don't think that they're, um, they're racist." (Page 37 Lines 1626-1632).

Officer Wells emphasized the content of their text messages were intended as jokes and never meant to become public. He also emphasized his use of the word "nigger" did not mirror his true feelings toward African Americans.

### Accused Officer Jason Holding (CCN# 1843)

On January 21, 2015, Officer Jason Holding provided a sworn digitally recorded statement to Sergeants Vetancourt and Brull. Prior to commencing the interview, Officer Holding and his Fraternal Order of Police Representative, Sergeant Michael Tucker reviewed the investigative packet. Officer Holding acknowledged he had reviewed "The Hoods" video made by Officer Alvarez, as part of the investigative packet.

The credit section at the end of "The Hoods" video was brought to Officer Holding's attention, which listed him as "WRITTEN BY JASON HOLDING." Officer Holding relayed the following:

"I had no involvement. I had no in - now - no knowledge of this video that is was gonna be made. I didn't provide anything for the video. I didn't even know my name was attached to it until I saw this, uh, credits printout." (Page 3 Lines 118-120).

Officer Holding confirmed the photograph of a crashed Ford Crown Victoria marked police unit depicted in the video was his marked unit. He advised he believed he was transported to the hospital after the photograph was taken. He further stated the picture of his marked unit was sent to him from someone

at the scene; however, he did not provide it to Officer Alvarez. He asserted he did not supply any of the images contained in the video including subversive images or of department resources.

Officer Holding recalled after receiving the video in form of a text message, he called Officer Alvarez and insisted "he delete it immediately." He then emphasized "I didn't want any part of that video." When asked if he found anything specifically offensive in the video, Officer Holding stated he found it offensive and if the video got in the "wrong hands" it would not be received in the context of a joke as Officer Alvarez had intended.

The interview then centered on the screenshots of text message conversations, obtained from Ms. Perez. Regarding (IMG# 1603) depicts a text message conversation solely between Officer Alvarez and Officer Wells. Officer Alvarez communicates "They are doing it to all the cars," in turn Officer Wells replies "Niggers," followed by "I know" from Officer Alvarez.

Officer Holding relayed Officer Wells use of the word "nigger" in the text conversation was not indicative of the communications he had with him and "not something the he uses on a regular basis." This is in stark contrast to the text message sampling provided by Ms. Perez.

(IMG# 1604) depicted text message conversation between Officers Alvarez and Wells. The first message dated "Mon, Sep 22, 1:39 PM, Officer Alvarez says "I tried sending it as a normal video lmk if it goes through." Officer Wells replies with his personal email address. Officer Holding maintained he had no insight as to "what they're referring to."

(IMG# 1604) contained an additional text conversation between Officers Wells and Alvarez dated "Tue, Sep, 23, 9:01 PM," Officer Wells sent a picture of a television screen with an unknown program on the screen. Officer Alvarez replied "Brother" to Officer Wells' text message. Officer Holding had no knowledge of the conversation he could provide.

(IMG# 1605) appeared to be sent by Officer Sousa to Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. The image depicted a white male lying across a broken chair with the caption "Alex at the substation." Officer Alvarez replies "Fo five." In turn, Officer Holding replied with a photograph of a Remington shotgun shell box with a caricature of an African American male picking his nose, with the caption "THE BUCK STOPS HERE."

Officer Holding was asked to explain his entry in the text message conversation. Officer Holding relayed the caricature on the shotgun shell box was of a "black male." Officer Holding indicated it was a photograph he located on the internet he thought was funny and "didn't mean any racial undertones by it." He then contended the caricature portrayed the male holding two fingers in front of his face and agreed it was a negative portrayal of African Americans.

(IMG# 1606) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, Sousa, and Alvarez. Officer Sousa sent a photograph of cow udders with the caption "Darren nipples," followed by Officer Wells' response "Holdings Lmfao." Officer Holding replied, "I will forever be holdings to sousas." Officer Wells' final entry in the screenshot is "Due to his poor Grammar like Cecil stone." Officer Holding

failed to provide any insight regarding the picture of the cow udders; however, he relayed the following regarding his contribution to the text message conversation:

"That - that was a joke that started back when I first started. Um, Sergeant (Stone) would - would call me on row - roll call and he'd, uh, call me by name Holdings. There - there's nothing more to that than - than him just calling me Holdings and not, uh, Officer Wells - er, uh, excuse me, Officer Sousa would always call me Holdings every time he saw me." (Page 8 Lines 333-337).

(IMG# 1607) depicted a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The conversation thread included a cutoff photo of the mouth of a Black male with gold teeth, followed by an entry by Officer Sousa, "You better have some boston lagers." Officer Holding replied "Only if you call them bastan laaagas," followed by a picture from Officer Wells of a gutted deer and a hunter seated next to it.

Officer Holding indicated he was making light of Officer Sousa's Massachusetts accent but had no knowledge of what message Officer Wells was trying to convey with the picture of the gutted deer.

(IMG# 1608) depicted a text message conversation amongst Officers Sousa, Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officer Holding initiates the conversation with "Al and Donnie sitting in the sub in their whitie tighties." Officer Alvarez responds "I towed 7 cars ... Darren's nipples got wet." Officer Holding replied "There was a 14 pointer in VIP tonight," followed by the aforementioned photograph of the Black male with gold teeth.

Officer Holding expressed the following his entry about "Al and Donnie in the sub":

"I - what - what I was trying to say in that is just Alex being all the time working so I guess being at substation just being comfortable like you were - like you would be at home in your, uh, you know, underwear." (Page 9 Lines 392-394).

Officer Holding could not recall who he was referring to as "Donnie."

Regarding Officer Alvarez's entry of towing seven cars, Officer Holding declared was an exaggeration and "there's no way he towed that many cars in a night." He then confirmed he and the other accused officers did not engage in any special enforcement for the purposes of having cars towed.

Officer Holding explained his text "There was a 14 pointer in VIP tonight," followed by the photograph of the Black male with gold teeth below:

"Yeah. When I say a 14-pointer that's just a large male. I mean it doesn't have to do with any black male, white male. It's just a large male. Um, as far as the - the - the black male with the gold teeth I - I just, um, found a picture that was funny online. Um, the first, you know, person that popped up I think that had gold teeth was a black male so I - I sent it out him." (Page 10 lines 431-435).

Despite his initial assertion that a "14 pointer" was "just" a large male, it can be inferred he was referring to the amount of gold teeth displayed in the aforementioned male's mouth. Although he indicated the image was one of the first to populate when queried online, it appears he would have had to utilize a specific search parameter other than "14 pointer" or "large male" to obtain that specific picture. This calls into question the veracity of this statement.

Regarding (IMG# 1609) depicts a sample of the conversation and appears to be the precursor to (IMG# 1608) and general conversation.

(IMG# 1610) portrays a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, Alvarez and Sousa. Officer Wells initiates the conversation with the entry of "Is there a lot of rentals up there? I know the answer so don't lie." Officer Alvarez replies with picture of a television and the caption "10-6 substation." Officer Holding advised he did not know what the other officers were discussing, but he did not observe any racial connotations in the screenshot.

(IMG# 1611) portrays a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, Alvarez and Sousa. The sample depicts a photograph of a police department photograph of Captain Kevin Sheehan sent by Officer Sousa. Officer Alvarez then communicates "Jimmy I've got sensitive signal 14 call me." Officer Holding advised he assumed Officer Sousa had sent the picture of Captain Sheehan due to their similar accents. He had no knowledge regarding Officer Alvarez's request to have Officer Wells call him.

(IMG# 1612) depicted a photograph of actor Martin Wuttke portraying Adolph Hitler in the film "Inglorious Bastards" with the caption "Schrida" below it. The photograph and caption appear to have been sent by Officer Alvarez to Officers Sousa, Wells and Holdings. None of the officers appeared to have replied to Officer Alvarez's text. Officer Holding opined Officer Alvarez's text message was likely due to his watching of World War II era movies.

Alvarez's communication was followed by a text message from Officer Sousa sent at 2:58 AM stating "Holdings we are coming and drinking all your beer and killing niggers." Officer Alvarez replies "Yesterday 1:40 PM," with a link to a YouTube video. The link was obscured by the text message entry box of the iPhone screen.

According to Officer Holding, he was not sure what Officer Sousa meant by his text message, and did not recall replying to the text message. He then stressed he did not believe Officer Sousa was sincere in his text message. When posed with the question if he and the other accused officers had engaged in hateful activity to harm African Americans or other racial minorities, Officer Holding advised the following:

"No. And - and from the - all the interactions I had with - with, uh, these officers in question they - they've only treated everybody no matter what their color, connotation, whatever their - whatever they were they always treat them with respect." (Page 12 Lines 515-518).

Officer Holding could not recall what video Officer Alvarez was directing the group to view, and asserted he received numerous group text messages and did not always review every single one. Officer Holding confirmed other than "The Hoods" iMovie, he was not aware of any other videos Officer Alvarez may have made which would embarrass the agency.

(IMG# 1613) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Wells, Holding, and Sousa. Officer Wells communicates "4 49 silents at schools." Officer Holding sends a photograph of World War II era bomber planes dropping munitions followed by "Alex, James, Chris, air campaign-total bombardment" and "On fou fife."

Officer Holding explained the text message conversation as the following:

"Yeah, absolutely. Um, the bombardment thing was just a - a thing that, you know, I was getting bombarded by, you know, the guys riding me and - and, uh, you know, they not particularly, you know, this group of guys but just guys I work with in general, you know, they know some personal things about me. Um, you know, they call me a - a liberal democrat because they know I'm a lifelong registered democrat and - and, you know, they - they call me a - a Haitian lover and - and, uh, you know, N lover and - and, um, you know, a mud shark because they - they know that I've, uh, dated a, you know, my current girlfriend is a, um, a black Haitian American. So it- it's just a play on that to - to, you know, I was gettin' a little, you know, I didn't think any of it was serious. It was all in good fun, all part of, you know, guys just taking little jabs at you but I just sent the a photo that, you know, that they were really bombarding me with, uh, with some, um, you know, teasing and - and stuff like that." (Page 13 Lines 545-558).

(IMG# 1614) includes a photograph of Officer Holding in a police academy photograph followed by the caption "plus this guy." In response Officer Alvarez replied, "I think I've watched the video over 1345677864321 times." Officer Holding believed Officer Sousa may have sent the academy photo of him to make light of how much he had aged since the photograph had been taken. He had no knowledge about Officer Alvarez's text about watching the movie an infinite amount of times.

(IMG# 1615) another text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa. The image depicts a narrative titled Nigger Winter which included racially offensive terms, followed by a photograph of a Black male on the ground with a white male standing over him with a firearm. The image was captioned, "Kansas where shootin a nigger is a sport." Both items were sent by Officer Alvarez. Officer Holding indicated he did not remember opening and reviewing the message from Officer Alvarez. He also communicated the text messages were not indicative of the text messages he would normally receive from Officer Alvarez. This statement is contrary to the sampling of text messages provided by Ms. Perez.

(IMG# 1616) was a screenshot of a text message preview screen and did not appear to have any information relevant to the allegations.

(IMG# 1617) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding and Wells. In the screenshot is an entry from Officer Alvarez stating "Jimmy what would big dad do to that nigger," and

"get that nigger out from under that wagon." In response Officer Wells replies "And that nigger lover in the wagon" followed by picture of KKK members surrounding a wagon from the film "Django Unchained." Officer Holding explained he had not seen the movie, therefore had no knowledge of what the other accused officers were referring to. He further stated none of the other accused officers ever expressed their thoughts about the movie to him.

(IMG# 1618) and (IMG #1619) were screenshots of lists of "Blocked" phone numbers. The content did not appear to be relative to the allegations.

(IMG# 1620) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez and Shushman. Officer Holding could not explain the context of the text messages. Officer Holding explained "pfft" was meant to express displeasure similar to a scoffing sound. When posed with the question as to the nature of Officers Alvarez and Shushman's relationship, Officer Holding stated "just work relationship." (Page 17 Line 723).

(IMG# 1621) is a duplicate of (IMG# 1617), which Officer Holding previously explained during his statement.

(IMG# 1622) depicted a text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. The screenshot includes the conclusion of a prior text conversation with an entry from Officer Alvarez of "Amen brother." The group text message conversation reinitiates "Yesterday 2:12 AM." The conversation is initiated by Officer Alvarez indicating he is in contact with Officer Thomas Taylor II. Officer Holding text "How bad does he hate em." Officer Alvarez replied, "We are talking about the Oklahoma nigger," followed by "Jimmy what would big dad do to that nigger."

In regards to his text of "How bad does he hate em," Officer Holding emphasized he was strictly referring to Mr. Nolen as a "terrorist" and not by his race. As to whether he found Officer Alvarez's text discussing the "Oklahoma nigger" offensive or shocking, he relayed the following:

"I just assumed that he was, you know, not being serious, not being - not trying to be, uh, you know, having any kind of, uh, race attached to it." (Page 17 lines 748-749).

(IMG# 1623) appears to be a discussion about Officer Sean Walters, involving Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officer Holding was asked to contextualize his entry "Walters isn't 26 bro." Officer Holding explained the conversation as the following:

"I - as far as the (Unintelligible) load and MC I - I don't believe I sent that one. Um, but I did send the, "(Walters) is in 26," um, and the, uh, the hood snob. It- it's nothing against the - anyone else or any other district. It's just I guess having that, um, competitive streak in me that where I'm working I feel like it's the - the best place to work. Um, I feel like that- that's where you get to, um, the people that - that need the help the most and it's where you get to actually help people. It's what I got in this job to do is to help people." (Page 18 Lines 765-771).

He further explained the remainder of the text message conversation was a criticism of Officer Walters for not having ever been assigned to District 2.

(IMG# 1624) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officers Alvarez and Holding exchanged messages criticizing their coworkers and officers assigned to the midnight shift. Officer Holding was asked to explain an entry made by Officer Alvarez stating "Might as well have been teddy Tim brown and Beltrani responding. These ppl are beyond low speed." Officer Wells responded "Fo fo." Officer Holding responded, "Lazy fucks, I couldn't even get a 105 last weekend." To which Alvarez responded, "Everyone on this midnight roster is a joke." Officer Holding indicated Officer Alvarez was referring Officers Theodore Levin, Timothy Ryan, Juanita T. Brown and Cristina Beltrani. Officer Holding identified both Officers Levin and Ryan as white males and Officer Brown as a Black female and Officer Beltrani as white female. Officer Holding agreed the content of the screen shot was a criticism of other officers' work ethic and had no racial context.

(IMG# 1625) is a screen shot of a text message exchange amongst Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Holding. Officer Wells initiated the conversation by stating "J can u get a bailout today pappey," in turn Officer Holding replies "Let the hunt begin." Officer Alvarez added, "J we each need bailouts today at the same time and multiple perimeters and cannon and tank to be called out." Officer Holding replies "Fo fo", followed by a response from Officer Wells of "Retarded brown."

Officer Holding confirmed there was no arrangement with Officer Cabrera to engage in any enforcement which would necessitate him to be called out. Officer Holding indicated "Cannon" is Officer Cabrera's K-9, but had no knowledge of who "Tank" is. Officer Holding's interpretation of Officer Alvarez's text message was that Officer Alvarez "looked up to" Officer Cabrera. He offered no insight into the text message from Officer Wells of "Retarded brown."

(IMG# 1626) depicts a text conversation between Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Alvarez was a recipient of the text messages; however, he did not appear to reply based on the screen shot provided by Ms. Perez. Officer Wells poses to Officer Holding, "J what if one of the three cars that my sig 10 hit was your personal vehicle." Officer Holding replies "I'd have the noose ready," in turn Officer Wells advises "It would be your luck tho driving home from bingo and a 10 hits u." Officer Holding concluded the conversation by texting an Emoji face "and Shannon shows up and takes my license." Officer Holding explained the content of the conversation as the following:

"That's just a hangman's noose and that was for me only. That, um, I know it can take - be taken out of context but that was - that was just me, you know, I obviously wasn't suicidal or anything, but it was just a - a play on, uh, I had a few accidents over the course of the year, and one more would have sent me off the edge. None of them were my fault, I might add." (Page 20 Lines 884-888).

Officer Holding further explained there was no racial connotation in the conversation regarding hanging African Americans and was related to being involved in another car accident.

(IMG# 1627) appeared to be the precursor to (IMG# 1626). Officer Alvarez does not appear to acknowledge the conversation between Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Wells communicates "It was

off air until he hit 3 cars at Andrews and sunrise." Officer Holding replies "Stones already reviewing the rat on the roof." The conversation then melds with (IMG# 1626) when Officer Wells replies "J what if one of the three cars that my sig 10 hit was your personal vehicle."

Officer Holding interpreted Officer Wells' texts possibly indicating he engaged in an unauthorized vehicular pursuit as the following:

"No, it was just a gloating thing, I guess it was a, you know, fish story, a tall tale. He never chased a car off the air." (Page 21 Lines 912-913).

Officer Holding explained his text regarding Sergeant Stone reviewing "the rat on the roof" below:

"(Stone)'s, um, the only - I think at the time he just came to IA. He's the only guy I knew that was over here, and, uh, just a - I believe IA reviews, um, the AVL. It's commonly heard - heard, um, called the rat on the roof." (Page 21 Lines 918-920).

Officer Holding relayed his text message listing his coworkers joining the District 2 Neighborhood Action Team was a joke as he believed they had requested a transfer to the unit.

(IMG# 1628) depicted a photograph of a white Mercedes Benz with front end damage followed by the inquiry from Officer Holding, "Hot sheet?" Officer Wells replies, "No fresh 10 from dist 1," in turn Officer Holding remarks "Crazy Nigger" and "I love chasing off the grid."

Officer Holding explained his contribution to the text message conversation and specifically his use of the term "Crazy nigger" as follows:

"That wasn't directed towards any particular race. Um, I - I didn't even know who was driving - I think I was off that day that he had that. Um, it was just a reference of, um, you know, the - the term - I regret it, using it - the term anymore is used so generally, it's almost used as, uh, as dude or bro or something like that. Um, the same way women now are using the term bitch, you know, "I'm out with my bitches," and there was no race undertones involved in that. And then the, um, chasing off the grid, that's just a - that's an embellishment. I don't chase off the grid." (Page 22 Lines 955-962).

When posed with the question if his texts endorsed chasing vehicles contrary to department policy, Officer Holding emphasized he was bragging or embellishing and did not engage in any unauthorized pursuits.

(IMG# 1629) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Wells and Holding. Officer Alvarez was a recipient of the text messages; however, he did not appear to reply. Officer Wells initiates the conversation with the entry "Papi I love bailouts," Officer Holding replies "In that co dade boy, You get another!?" Officer Wells in turn replies, "J ur boys in the vw bailed on me" and "Not the vw but a sig 10 mercedes. Nigger hit 3 cars and then crashed and bailed out." Officer Holding replies, "If that's true I'll kiss your ass, I want those niggers."

Officer Holding explained his texts in the conversation as the following:

"I can't remember what I was talking about that. Um, I just know that rapper, um, one of the rappers from Miami days says "County Dade," that's - that's the only thing I can think of from that. It's Trick Daddy, says he's from the County Dade. Um, and as far as you - you get another, I just - I think I was inquiring whether he got another bailout." (Page 23 Lines 990-994).

Officer Holding stated Officer Wells' use of the word "nigger" was not indicative of the totality of all of their text communications. It was brought to his attention the screenshots provided to the Office of Internal Affairs likely contained only a three to four week sample of the communications amongst himself and the other accused officers. Officer Holding indicated all of their messages were not hateful and the timeframe of the texts were consistent with the time Officer Alvarez started the group text messages. Officer Holding confirmed he never contacted Officer Alvarez to express he found any of his messages inappropriate.

(IMG# 1630) depicts a text message conversation involving Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Holding makes an entry on "Thursday 4:28 AM" of "I bout killed a man on 2 st boys." Neither Officer Alvarez nor Officer Wells acknowledged the entry. On "Thursday 9:13 PM" Officer Wells communicates "Thanks bro," Officer Alvarez replies, "This faggot just said he's asthmatic and had an attack 2 days." Officer Wells in turn replies with Emoji pictures of six fists and a monkey. Officer Alvarez replies "Med clearance ... Jimmy I'm gonna s/5 him," followed by "With the boomerang."

Officer Holding explained his text of "I bout killed a man on 2 st boys" as the following:

"Um, what I was referring to is, uh, I was out - I was out pretty late, as you can see, on my own time. I picked up a slice of - or tried to pick up a slice of pizza at, uh, Squiggy's, a downtown pizzeria. Um, there was four or five large, um, white males, MMA fighters, um, that tried to pick a fight with me. I tried to, you know, it all started - one of the guys was kind of standing back and I, you know, nicely asked him, "Hey, you in line or what's going on?" And he made a big deal about it. Uh, I guess he was around all his friends, and they said they're MMA fighters, and I was able to, you know, kind of calm them all down and, you know, they left and - but there wasn't any, you know, this is just another one of those embellished stories." (Page 24 Lines 1044-1053).

Officer Holding further explained the incident did not garner the attention of a sergeant who was parked in front of the restaurant nor was the encounter physical and all the parties involved were white males. Therefore, there was no racial context behind his text message.

Regarding Officer Alvarez's entry indicating "I'm gonna s/5 him", Officer Holding indicated he believed Officer Alvarez was venting his frustration over being tasked with the medical clearance as the process can be time consuming and unpleasant. He believed Officer Alvarez was not sincere in his text message and was not intent on murdering his prisoner. Officer Holding indicated he believed Officer Alvarez's reference to the "boomerang" was relative to a picture of folding knife included in the

screenshots. In regards to Officer Wells' text message of a series of Emoji pictures, Officer Holding indicated Officer Wells may have been "frustrated" and sent a picture of an animal.

(IMG# 1631) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez and Holding. Officer Wells appears to be listed as a recipient of the conversation did not appear to participate. Officer Holding appears to express his frustration of his lack of romantic progress with a Cuban female and not relevant to the allegations. He specifically text, "Just a fucking make out session" and "Fucking cubanas". Officer Alvarez responds with "Pfttt that's a 98 bravo kid what happened." Holding retorted "The panty dropper had it's first fail" followed by "This chick was high class cuban, nada impressed her" and "Fucking cuban elite." Officer Holding indicated there was no racial context in his text conversation and the female he referred to was Caucasian.

(IMG# 1632) depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. The screenshot includes a photograph of Sergeant Paul Cristafaro and Officer Pedro Cabrera engaged in K-9 training. The sender of the photograph is not revealed in the screen shot, and none of the accused officers appear to comment on the photograph. Officer Holding emphasized with a "100% certainty" he did not take the photograph, nor did he send it.

(IMG# 1633) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Holding initiates the conversation "Got some strange 51 to the galt," followed by "I had a wet dream that you two found those two niggers in the VW and gave them the death penalty right there on the spot." Officer Wells replies "J I was hunting for that car in dist 5 today" and "I would hurt them". Officer Alvarez replies "I was in district 6794 looking for it as well."

Officer Holding explained his interpretation of his text messages to Officers Wells and Alvarez as the following:

"Again, it - I - I never had that dream, it was another, um, embellished story that, um, that I didn't think that those guys would do any harm to anyone or I would do any harm to anyone. Um, and, you know, like I said before, I don't know who was driving the vehicle or - so there - there wasn't any racial, um, references for that." (Page 27 Lines 1169-1173).

His attention was directed to the graphic and violent content of his text message specifically the use of the word "niggers" coupled with his reference to administering the "death penalty" on the spot. The question was posed whether it was indicative of his feelings towards people he dealt with on calls for service, including racial minorities or African Americans. Officer Holding explained the following:

"No, absolutely not. That's, uh, that can be more opposite of what - how I treat people, um, on a day to day basis. Um, it, you know, I was pretty frustrated. Everybody that's in this room can attest that the car takes off on you, it's a frustrating feeling. Uh, just venting a little, uh, frustration and - but there was no, um, I didn't even have the ability to act on that because I would have no idea. It was just blowing off steam, and I - I didn't know who was in vehicle. Um, it was a rental car and it - like I said, I was just venting some frustration." (Page 27 Lines 1181-1187).

FOP Representative Sergeant Michael Tucker requested Officer Holding clarify his use the word "nigger," as he had made prior statements indicating he used the word to refer to "potential targets or bad guys or criminals" and not any specific race or group of people. Officer Holding retorted "no matter what race they are, um, it's pretty much became - the N word's." (Page 27 Lines 1199-1200).

The question was posed to Officer Holding whether he was referring to "lawbreakers" or singling out African Americans with his use of the word "nigger" in his text messages. Officer Holding responded the following:

"I'm not singling out African Americans. Um, like I said before it's, uh, it's a term used in hip cop - hip hop culture and - and popular culture for, um, you know, just a dude or something like that." (Page 28 Line 1244-1246).

When asked if he was advocating violence against African Americans with his use of the word nigger and his reference to giving them the death penalty, he replied "Absolutely not."

Regarding Officer Wells' response to his text message of "J, I was hunting for that car in dist 5 today. I would hurt them," Officer Holding surmised, "No, I just think that, you know, hurt them by, you know, stroking them some tickets, uh, things like that - punitive, um, measures, not - not anything physical."

(IMG# 1634) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Alvarez makes an entry of "Look at those Cobras bro." In response Officer Holding sends a picture of a pocket knife with the caption, "King cobras." Officer Holding explained the following:

"That's (Alex)'s knife and - and like I said before, um, I think that belongs with the - the boomerang, um, that hooks onto that part of, uh, the text message. Um, the King Cobra's a - if I remember correctly I think (Alex) sent me a picture of him in the gym with his, you know, pointing to his forearm - it's commonly referred to as a - a Cobra. I don't know if you guys ever heard that term, but - and, you know, I thought it was pretty big, so I called it a King Cobra." (Page 29 Lines 1281-1287).

Officer Holding maintained he did not perceive any racial context behind the conversation, nor did he believe Officer Alvarez intended to stab anyone. He further stated Officer Alvarez, "was just impressed by it, thought it was a cool knife."

(IMG# 1635) contains a discussion amongst Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officers Wells and Holding discuss training. Officer Alvarez sends them a picture of him and Officer Rolando Rivera giving a "thumbs up" hand gesture, while seated at a restaurant. Officer Holding stated there was no racial or subversive context in the text message conversation.

(IMG# 1636) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Holding and Wells. Although it appears Officer Alvarez received the conversational texts, he did not participate in the portion captured in the screenshot. A link to a Sun Sentinel article about an armed robbery and kidnapping followed by "That's probably who was in that VW." The sender is undetermined due to the position of the text in the

screen shot, however the text is positioned on the left side of the screen indicating Officer Alvarez did not initiate the text. Officer Wells replied "Couple of goons," in turn Officer Holding communicates "Couple of armed jack boys papiiiiii" and "Shoot out at OK Coral," followed by a link to a YouTube video of a scene from the movie "Tombstone," depicting a shootout amongst a group of marshals and some outlaws. Officer Holding contextualized the text message conversation as the following:

"Yeah, that, um, I - I'm pretty sure I sent that link to the Sun Sentinel article. Um, it was a similar car, it was a Volkswagen. The colors didn't match, um, and I think they were, you know, they were armed robbery guys, AKA jack boys. Um, I was just kind of trying to embellish the story that those were the - you know, that's - that's why the guys took off from me. You know, it wasn't that they were, uh, had an invalid DL or something, they - they may have been those jack boys, but, you know, like I said it was a different color car. Um, it was just a - just kind of a - just to embellish the story." (Page 30 Lines 1329-1336).

Officer Holding did not recall who may have sent the link to the YouTube video and maintained he did not view the video contained in the link. However, a review of the text message screen shot appears to indicate he was the source of the YouTube link.

(IMG# 1637) depicts a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Holding is listed as a recipient; however, he did not appear to contribute to the conversation. Officer Alvarez initiated the conversation by sending a picture of himself making an odd facial gesture. Officer Wells replied "Damn kid. U look ready for off the grid." Officer Holding indicated he was unaware of what Officers Alvarez and Wells were discussing but emphasized the term "off the grid" meant to him instances when he did not have "cell phone service" or not responding to text messages. This is contradictory to his previous explanations to the phrase "off the grid" earlier in his statement with regards to (IMG# 1628).

(IMG# 1638) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. Officer Wells did not appear to acknowledge the texts from Officers Holding and Alvarez. Officer Holding initiates the conversation with the entry "3412 ocean." Officer Alvarez responds "J.. Ol Jimmy Dean put tinfoil on his phone," followed by "He's dark" and an internet meme with a photograph of actors wearing tin foil hats on their heads from the film "Signs". The photograph included the caption "Tin Foil – FREE YOUR MIND." Officer Holding replies "Yeah he's totally deep behind enemy lines."

Officer Holding explained the conversation as the following:

"Yeah, that's, um, I assume from that that, you know, he's dark, meaning he's off the grid, the power grid, you know, um, just being a - he's not actually off the grid, he's not without power, it's just, um, you know, he's not responded to his texts, and, uh, the tin foil was the - I think (Alex) made a joke, I - I think there's a photograph of - or a photograph of it where the phone is in tin foil, 'cause a lot of times my, uh, you know, I didn't have, um, cell phone service at my condo." (Page 32 Lines 1399-1405).

Officer Holding confirmed his reference to a picture of phone wrapped in tin foil was to a picture included in "The Hoods" iMovie. Officer Holding speculated the picture of the blood-soaked tile floor in "The Hoods" iMovie may have been from a Baker Act call however could not remember when it exactly occurred or who the primary officer was assigned to the call.

(IMG# 1639) portrays a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells. Officer Alvarez makes an entry of "Useless shits" and "Jimmy you got pizza?" In response, Officer Wells replies "Niggers everywhere." Officer Holding adds "Alex I grabbed you one to go."

Officer Holding explained his recollection of the events referenced in the text message and his perception of Officer Wells' text "Niggers everywhere" below:

"No knowledge where - where he was on that. Um, I don't - I don't think that belongs with that - where that is because I know about the pizza. We, um, Officer (Wells) and I went to the FOP and - and, uh, grabbed some pizza that they were making out there, and - and, uh, went back, hit the road. Um, so I - I don't know if that belongs or what - what the context of that is. I - I just - I couldn't tell you." (Page 33 Lines 1460-1465).

When asked if the screenshots of the group text messaged appeared altered, Officer Holding contended "Um, they just don't seem like they line up in - in order at times." (Page 34 Line 1483). The remainder of the group text was work related.

(IMG #1640) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The image captured a portion of a text message from Officer Alvarez of "randy combined." In response, Officer Wells replies with an Emoji picture of a ghost followed by "the hoods" and concluded again with an Emoji picture of a ghost. Officer Holding replies "Torons a fellow mudshark." When questioned, Officer Holding claimed the comment was a reference to his own interracial relationship. Officer Holding explained his text of "Torons a fellow mudshark" as the following:

"I don't know if that was a response to anything that he said, but as far as me saying that, um, just kind of making light, making fun of myself, how they - guys kind of poke fun of, you know, me, uh, dating a, um, a Haitian, black Haitian American girl." (Page 35 Lines 1528-1531).

He further explained the entry was a joke and identified "Toron" as Officer Wells' dog. The remainder of the group text message was not relevant to the allegations.

Officer Holding provided no insight regarding Officer Alvarez's initial cut off text message. Regarding Officer Wells' text of "the hoods" with Emoji ghost pictures, Officer Holding affirmed the only time he heard the term the hoods was from the iMovie. Officer Holding asserted there are no groups within the agency known as "The Hoods" and the term originated from Officer Alvarez's video

(IMG #1641) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The screenshot captured a portion of a text message conversation between Officer Alvarez and Officer Wells. The communication starts with an entry from Officer Alvarez of "Fo five," followed by a series of

Emoji pictures of tearful smiling face from Officer Wells. The text conversation re-initiates on "Wed, Oct 1, 8:07 P.M." with the opening shot of "The Hoods" video sent by Officer Alvarez.

Officer Holding explained "Fo five" was a word play on his call sign of 45. Officer Holding confirmed he received Officer Alvarez's iMovie "The Hoods" in the fashion captured in the screenshot.

(IMG #1642) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding and Alvarez. The screenshot appears to be a continuation of the prior screenshot (IMG# 1641). The text conversation initiates on "Wed, Oct 1, 8:07 P.M." with the opening scene of "The Hoods" video sent by Officer Alvarez. Officer Wells replied "10 8," followed by an entry of "It's all we have left" from Officer Holding. The question was posed to Officer Holding whether Officer Wells' and his text message were an endorsement of the video. Officer Holding replied the following:

"No, it's not in relation to the video at all. Um, the only thing I can think of following, um, Officer (Wells)' 10-8 is, uh, just work. You know, that's all - that's all there is left, go to work and that's it." (Page 36 Lines 1577-1579).

(IMG# 1643) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding, and Alvarez. The conversation was cropped in the screenshot therefore the sender could not be determined. However Officers Wells and Holding were listed as the recipients and their communications are situated on the left side of the screen eliminating Officer Alvarez as the source of the content. The screenshot included a cutoff text of "one" followed by "Down." Below the text was an image of a wanted poster for Mr. Jesse Leroy Matthew Jr., followed by the entry "this nigger raped and killed four and raped." Officer Holding denied sending any of the content depicted in the screenshot.

(IMG# 1644) is dated "Sun, Sep 28, 4:27 PM," the screenshot depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officer Wells is listed as a recipient of the messages but did not appear to join in the text conversation. Officer Holding sends a picture of two African American males riding a horse, followed by the caption of "Deadwood and randy riding bravo." On "Sun Sep 28, 9:01 PM," Officer Alvarez sends a picture of a white male holding a rifle with a white teenage female looking at him. The picture appears to be from an internet source and is captioned "RULES FOR DATING MY DAUGHTER." Officer Holding explained his contribution to the group text as the following:

"Um, what I'm saying there is, um, just the fact that Officer (Lockwood), um, I think he recently was accepted into the, uh, Mounted Unit, so I just went online and tried to find the funniest picture I could find of, uh, um, a person riding a horse that matched, you know, um, Officer (Lockwood). And then, you know, since there's another guy on there I just threw another guy we worked with on there." (Page 37 Lines 1619-1624).

He further explained the second male on the horse was meant to portray Officer Randy Washington and there was no malicious intent behind the photo rather was a point of accuracy as both officers are African American. Regarding Officer Alvarez's photograph about "RULES FOR DATING MY DAUGHTER," Officer Holding did not recall receiving the message and assumed it was a commercial portraying a protective father.

(IMG# 1645) is dated "Sun, Sep 28, 1:02 AM," the screenshot depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Wells, Officer Holding, and Officer Alvarez. Officer Wells is listed as a recipient but does not appear to acknowledge the message from Officer Holding. Officer Alvarez would have received the message according to the screenshot but did not reply to the message from Officer Holding either. Officer Holding sends a picture of a white female posing with several Black males. The picture is captioned above "you know her dad is at home re-evaluating his life." Below the picture is a text message relaying "God please no daughters." Officer Holding explained his text message as the following:

"Um, I - I can see how that would be interpreted, um, but only the fact that she's with, um, you know, looks like four or five or six males. No matter what color they are, um, just being around them, um, and then I - I think I replied, you know, "God, please no daughters." Um, just the fact that, you know, it doesn't have anything to do with race. You know, I - obviously I - I'm not anti, um, interracial dating. I think I established that earlier. Um, so there's - there's no racial undertones in that, by sending that." (Page 38 Lines 1663-1669).

(IMG# 1646) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The screenshot contains a cropped text message of "highest quality." The sender and complete content are not visible. Below the aforementioned text is an entry from Officer Wells of "He stole a role of it from Santa Barbara," followed by a screenshot of the opening credits of Officer Alvarez's "The Hoods" video. The image sent by Officer Wells garnered a response from Officer Alvarez as indicated by a green text message bubble. The content cannot be seen as the Officer Alvarez's text is obscured by the text message entry box of the iPhone. Officer Holding did not know what Officer Wells intended to convey with his text message.

(IMG# 1647) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officer Alvarez initiates the conversation with "There's a grudge going on right there." The conversation continues on "Sat, Sep 27, 8:34 PM" when Officer Wells sends a text message of "Watching Django right now," along with two Emoji pictures of two tearful smiling faces. In response, Officer Alvarez replied, "It's a movie about Lockwood." In turn, Officer Holding sent an internet screenshot from Google which appeared to be of a man holding a lap dog. The cropped title of the image appeared to possibly be "dog watching tv side by side with man."

Officer Holding relayed he had no knowledge of the context of Officer Alvarez's message regarding a "grudge." He further stated he had not seen the movie "Django Unchained" however believed Officer Alvarez's entry of "It's a movie about Lockwood" was in response to photograph of the two Black males riding a horse. He expressed he did not perceive any negative racial context in the conversation. The photograph of a man holding a lap dog was intended as a joke directed at Officer Wells' K-9 partner.

(IMG# 1648) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. Officer Alvarez did not appear to contribute to the conversation. The screenshot starts with a grey text bubble; however, the content and sender are obscured by the recipient box of the iPhone screen. Preceding the obscured text bubble is an image of Mr. Nolen with a narrative describing his crime. Preceding the image of Mr. Nolen is a text entry of "This

nigger beheaded a lady today in Oklahoma." The sender or their phone number was not captured by the screenshot of the text conversation. Below the aforementioned communication Officer Holding's phone number appears above a grey text message bubble. Officer Holding's response was obscured by the text message entry box of the iPhone screen. Officer Holding denied being the sender of the photograph and text pertaining to Mr. Nolen.

(IMG# 1650) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officer Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The conversation depicted in the screenshot starts with an image of a nuclear blast mushroom cloud, the sender appears to be Officer Alvarez as the image is situated on the right side of the screen. The text message continues on "Monday 6:52 PM" when Officer Holding sends a text of "Alana new nickname, the fat rat." On "Monday 9:14 PM" Officer Wells sent a photograph which was severely cropped and its content could not be determined.

According Officer Holding, he relayed the picture of the mushroom cloud was meant to depict a "bombardment" of teasing or jokes as previously referenced in his statement about (IMG# 1613).

Regarding the following text message in the screenshot on "Monday 6:52 PM," Officer Holding stated Officer Ashley was the topic of the conversation and explained the context of his text messages below:

"I - just - it's a terrible joke about her body weight. Um, fat rhymes with rat, it just - looking back, I, you know, I should - should never have made fun of somebody for their, you know, being a little husky. Um, you know, she could have something that's totally out of her control, you know, a thyroid problem or something like that. It's something I regret saying, among other things." (Page 41 Lines 1794-1798).

(IMG# 1651) depicts a text message conversation amongst Officers Wells, Holding and Alvarez. Officers Wells and Holding are listed as recipients. The screenshot appears to be a near duplicate of (IMG# 1637) however it includes a text message from Officer Holding stating, "The prob is with these new hires and the FTO's." His message was not relevant to the allegations.

(IMG# 1652) is a duplicate of (IMG# 1620) which depicted a text message conversation between Officers Alvarez and Shushman. When queried, Officer Holding advised they had a work relationship.

(IMG# 1653) appears to be a blank iPhone "Info" screen with no discernible content.

(IMG# 1654) appears to be an iPhone "Info" screen with Officer Shushman's phone number with an entry indicating "Outgoing Call" to Officer Shushman's phone number "Today at 9:01 AM" lasting one minute.

The remainder of the interview focused on the totality of all Officer Holding's text communication with Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Sousa, his relationships with the aforementioned officers and his knowledge of Officers Alvarez's alleged activities.

Officer Holding claimed his use of the "N word" did not always have a negative connotation. He also advised the totality of their group text messages did not have a negative racial component, which was not reflected in the three to four week sample provided by Ms. Perez.

Officer Holding reiterated his relationship with his girlfriend, whom he stressed, is a Black Haitian female. Officer Holding stressed he would not use the "N word" while speaking with her and believed she would find it offensive.

When posed with the question as to whether his involvement in this matter would cause both him and the department embarrassment, Officer Holding agreed the matter would cause embarrassment; however, given the opportunity to explain himself, it would cause less of an embarrassment.

Officer Holding communicated if given the opportunity to do things differently he would do the following:

"Yeah, I would - I would definitely do everything differently. I - I wouldn't - wouldn't use the, uh, the N word. I know I only used it a few times, but a few times is too many. Um, I see that, um, definitely learned a lot from this." (Page 46 Lines 2010-2012).

Officer Holding categorized the nature of his relationship with Officer Wells as "work friends" and had "the guys come over after a detail." When asked if this may have been the occasion Officer Sousa sent the text message regarding drinking beer and killing niggers, Officer Holding replied, "I think so." (Page 48 Line 2015). Officer Holding did not believe Officer Sousa was being sincere and he would not stand for it if he was.

He relayed he had more of a relationship with Officers Alvarez and Wells as they worked together. He explained he had a lesser relationship with Officer Sousa as he was assigned to a different district and shift. Officer Holding indicated they had only spent time outside of work on one occasion for some "Boston Lagers."

When posed with the question whether he would consider Officers Alvarez, Wells, and Sousa legitimate racists, he stated the following:

"No, and - and, uh, like I said, that's nothing that I would, um, would stand for. Um, in fact, you know, I - I was pretty impressed with, um, the way that Officer (Alvarez) and Officer (Wells) always treated everyone with respect. Um, and I'm the same way, you know, I came from private industry, and I treat everybody like customers, you know, give them customer service, and - and they did the same thing." (Page 48 Lines 2131-2136).

Officer Holding was questioned regarding his knowledge of a child abuse investigation Officer Alvarez handled. Ms. Perez alleged Officer Alvarez had been "in trouble" as he did not file a report. Based on the documentation relative to the matter, Sergeant Siekierski found deficiencies with his report and sent other officers to fully investigate the matter. Upon further review it was discovered the second responding units' investigation led to an arrest. Officer Holding recalled Officer Alvarez mentioning the incident to him. Officer Holding stated he was off duty when the call occurred but had heard about it from Officer Alvarez. According to Officer Holding, Officer Alvarez communicated the father had the

right to administer corporal punishment. Officer Holding affirmed Officer Alvarez never mentioned the race of parties involved during their discussion rather defended his decision not to take action.

Officer Holding confirmed he never received any videos via text message from Officer Alvarez, depicting mistreatment of African Americans as Ms. Perez alleged.

Near the conclusion of the interview, FOP Representative, Sergeant Tucker requested a few points of clarification of Officer Holding. In response to Sergeant Tucker's points of clarification, Officer Holding maintained he was not a racist nor would he be involved in a long-term relationship with a Black female if he harbored such feelings. Officer Holding communicated he preferred to work predominately black neighborhoods as that is where he felt the police assistance is needed the most. He further advised he had never treated anyone differently due to their color or race while carrying out his police duties.

At the conclusion of the interview, Officer Holding relayed he did not perceive Officers Alvarez, Wells, or Sousa to be racists nor did they enforce laws differently upon African Americans. More specifically, Officer Alvarez never communicated to him he would enforce laws more diligently upon African Americans as opposed to other ethnic groups as alleged by Ms. Perez. Officer Holding also confirmed Officer Alvarez never shared any sentiment with him regarding refusing to watch any particular movies with African American actors or eat at restaurants where African American patrons were present as stated by Ms. Perez.

#### **EXHIBITS/EVIDENCE**

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Offense Incident Report (OR# 14-239794): Copy of Offense Incident Report 14-239794 authored by Officers Arena and Houston. The report detailed the theft of Mr. Ehring's white 2008 Mercedes E350 from 118 NW 5 Street and the vehicle's recovery at 200 E Sunrise Boulevard.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplemental Report (OR# 14-239794): Copy of Supplemental Report OR# 14-239794 authored by Officer Wells. The report detailed Officer Wells' attempt to initiate a traffic stop on the white Mercedes E350. The report also encapsulated Mr. Barnes' involvement in a hit and run accident, as well as his flight and ultimate arrest.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supplemental Reports (OR# 14-239794): Copy of Supplemental Report OR# 14-239794 authored by Officer Caldera. The report detailed Officer Caldera's interaction with Mr. Barnes. Officer Caldera noted Mr. Barnes was secured in his police car and later led him to where property from the Mercedes had been discarded.

Florida Traffic Crash Report (DHSMV Crash Report Number 85018267) FLPD OR# 14-239814: Copy of Florida Traffic Crash Report OR# 14-239814 completed by PSA Polan. His report noted the suspect vehicle fled the accident scene at a high rate of speed and left the roadway striking a raised curb. Upon coming to rest in a ditch, the vehicle occupants fled on foot.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Fleeing Vehicle Review reference (OR# 14-239794): The review of the matter was conducted by Sergeant Siekierski. His review concluded the incident was conducted within the guidelines set forth in the Fort Lauderdale Police Department's Policy. The review was approved by the three district captains and Acting Assistant Chief Victor London.

Broward Sheriff's Office Communication Division Dispatch Recordings and Incident Summaries: Incident Summary (L34141009239794) encapsulated Mr. Ehring's call reporting his Mercedes stolen. Incident Summary (L34141009239814) encapsulated Officer Wells' radio transmissions regarding the hit and run accident and Mr. Barnes' flight and apprehension. Incident Summary (L34141009239817) captured a call from a driver whose vehicle was struck by the stolen Mercedes driven by Mr. Barnes. Incident Summary (L34141009239825) encapsulates a call from "Vanessa" regarding involvement in a car accident.

<u>CD of traffic camera footage and associated email requests:</u> Emails to Ms. Gladys Hola of American Traffic Solutions, requesting the traffic camera footage from the intersection of NW 15 Avenue and West Sunrise Boulevard for 6:45 PM to 7:05 PM. The reviewed footage appeared to be consistent with Officer Wells' written account of the event, and failed to reveal any police vehicle engaged in an attempt to pursue or overtake a white Mercedes Benz.

<u>CD of Ms. Royster's sworn statement obtained by Officer Alvarez:</u> Ms. Royster's statement delineated the sequence of events prior to the attempted traffic stop initiated by Officer Wells. She recounted Mr. Barnes' involvement in the hit and run accident, his subsequent flight, and admission the Mercedes was stolen.

Transactional Archived Report (TAR) for Officer Wells' queries on October 9, 2014, of the NCIC/FCIC database: The document indicated Officer Wells queried Florida tag (MANT) attached to the Mercedes at 6:53:49 PM. Officer Wells' query revealed "NO NCIC WANT" for NCIC and "NO RECORD FOUND" for FCIC.

<u>Automated Vehicle Locater (AVL) Report obtained via "Track Star" program:</u> The report encompassed Officer Wells' assigned police vehicle's location and speeds for October 9, 2014, from 11:06 AM to 11:59 PM. The vehicle's location and speeds leading to and subsequent to the attempted traffic stop of the Mercedes are contained on pages 100 and 101.

Petition For Injunction For Protection Against Domestic Violence filed by Ms. Perez: The Petition For Injunction For Protection Against Domestic Violence" (Case No. 14-025180-FC-04), was filed by Ms. Perez in the Circuit Court of the Eleventh Judicial Circuit in Dade County, Florida.

Temporary Injunction For Protection Against Domestic Violence Without Minor Child (ren): The Honorable Circuit Court Judge Tanya Brinkley granted Ms. Perez a "Temporary Injunction For Protection Against Domestic Violence Without Minor Child (ren)." Officer Alvarez was listed as the respondent and a hearing on the matter was set before the Honorable Joseph I. Davis Jr. for November 4, 2014, at 9:45 AM.

Order of Dismissal issued by Judge Joseph I. Davis Jr.:

Joseph I. Davis Jr. found "NO JUST CAUSE" for the court to issue an injunction for protection against domestic, repeat, dating, sexual violence or stalking, therefore the temporary injunction was dismissed without prejudice.

Broward County Domestic/Repeat Violence Injunctions Proof of Service Form: The document and attached return service form documented Officer Alvarez was served a "Domestic Violence Injunction" by BSO Civil Division Deputy Ed Alvarez (CCN# 4242) on October 29, 2014, at the Office of Internal Affairs. The form noted Officer Alvarez surrendered his firearms to the Office of Internal Affairs.

Fort Lauderdale Police Department Offense Incident Report (OR# 14-251080): Copy of Offense Incident Report 14-251080 authored by Sergeant Vetancourt. The report detailed Officer Alvarez surrendering his firearms pursuant to temporary injunction. As well as how the firearms were secured in police evidence on October 29, 2014, and later returned to Officer Alvarez on November 7, 2014, pursuant to the order of dismissal.

Fort Lauderdale Police Evidence/Property Form (OR# 14-251080): The form itemized the firearms, ammunition, and magazines Officer Alvarez surrendered on October 29, 2014. The form was signed by Officer Alvarez on November 7, 2014, acknowledging the return of the aforementioned items.

<u>Initial email from "hilarygonzalez6@gmail.com" to Police Chief Franklin Adderley:</u> Ms. Perez's initial email to Chief Adderley advising of racism within the Department, and alleging to have "racist" text messages involving Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells.

<u>Eleven emails with attachments from Ms. Perez to Chief Adderley:</u> In order to send the multiple attachments via email, Ms. Perez separated the screenshots of the text messages amongst a series of eleven emails. The emails were directed to Chief Adderley and subsequently forwarded to the Office of Internal Affairs.

<u>Email to Ms. Perez affording her an opportunity to provide a sworn statement on the matter:</u> Sergeant Cortes contacted Ms. Perez via email and afforded her the opportunity to provide a sworn statement.

<u>Consent to Remove & Search Computer Equipment/Copy Electronic Data:</u> The form was signed by Ms. Perez reflecting her consent to access and copy data from the iPhone she provided the Office of Internal Affairs.

<u>Consent to Search Form (Electronic Media):</u> The form was signed by Ms. Perez indicating her consent to allow the Office of Internal Affairs to review the images and data contained in the iPhone 5 she provided the Office of Internal Affairs.

<u>Copy of Domestic Violence Pamphlet issued to Ms. Perez by the Miami-Dade Police Department (MDPD):</u> The document indicated the pamphlet was issued to Ms. Perez on October 13, 2014, by MDPD Officers M. Tirado and J. Perez. The "Police case #" recorded on the document was PD141013373467.

<u>Copy of letter from Doral View Apartments Property Manager Janet Hernandez:</u> The letter authored by Ms. Hernandez documented Ms. Perez and Officer Alvarez terminated their lease on October 14, 2014.

Miami-Dade Police Department Offense Incident Report #PD141013373467: The report was authored by MDPD Officers M. Tirado and J. Perez and titled "Domestic Dispute" and listed both Ms. Perez and Officer Alvarez the "Reporting Person." The report indicated Officer Alvarez and Ms. Perez were involved in a verbal dispute at their shared residence.

A Fort Lauderdale Police Department Supervisor/ Employee Interview Form issued to Officer Alvarez by Lieutenant Steve Scelfo and related reports: The document memorialized Officer Alvarez's failure to make proper notifications. Future corrective measures would be addressed through required training. Fort Lauderdale Police Department Offense Incident Report OR# 14-210380 and supplemental reports relative to the accusations made by Ms. Perez during her statement.

"The Epoch Times" online article "Alton Alexander Nolen Case: Police ID Alton Nolen as the Suspect in OKC Beheading": The article dated September 26, 2014, described Mr. Nolen's crime in Oklahoma City, Oklahoma.

<u>Detective Fernandez's memorandum to the Office of Internal Affairs:</u> Detective Fernandez's memorandum indicated he completed a UFED Logical Report, UFED MMS Report and UFED Logical Chats/MMS Report, all of which contained files specific to Officer Alvarez's phone number. His aforementioned reports and data, images, and video retrieved from the iPhone were placed on a CD. The screenshots of the inappropriate text messages and "The Hoods" iMovie were located on the phone and consistent with the attachments Ms. Perez had emailed Chief Adderley.

<u>Florida Department of Law Enforcement (FDLE) Officer Requirements:</u> FDLE provides their definition of conduct unbecoming and policy in their "Law Enforcement Officer Ethical Standards of Conduct," which is intended as a supplement to the International Association of Chiefs of Police's Law Enforcement Code of Ethics.

Notice of Internal Affairs Investigation to Officer Alvarez: Officer Alvarez was notified of the Internal Affairs investigation, as well issued a direct order from Internal Affairs Major Dietrich to refrain from contacting Ms. Perez. The form was signed by Officer Alvarez on October 17, 2014.

Notice of Internal Affairs Investigation to Officer Wells: Officer Wells was notified of the Internal Affairs investigation, as well issued a direct order from Internal Affairs Major Dietrich to refrain from contacting Ms. Perez. The form was signed by Officer Wells on October 17, 2014.

Notice of Internal Affairs Investigation to Officer Holding: Officer Holding was notified of the Internal Affairs investigation, as well issued a direct order from Internal Affairs Major Dietrich to refrain from contacting Ms. Perez. The form was signed by Officer Holding on October 17, 2014.

Notice of Internal Affairs Investigation to Officer Sousa: Officer Sousa was notified of the Internal Affairs investigation, as well issued a direct order from Internal Affairs Major Dietrich to refrain from contacting Ms. Perez. The form was signed by Officer Sousa on October 21, 2014.

Relief from Duty Memorandum# 14-10-1 for Officer Alvarez: Issued and signed for by Officer Alvarez on October 17, 2014.

Relief from Duty Memorandum# 14-10-2 for Officer Wells: Issued and signed for by Officer Wells on October 17, 2014.

Relief from Duty Memorandum# 14-10-3 for Officer Sousa: Issued and signed for by Officer Sousa on November 20, 2014.

Relief from Duty Memorandum# 14-10-4 for Officer Holding: Issued and signed for by Officer Holding on December 8, 2014.

<u>Charging Document for Officer Alvarez:</u> Issued and signed for by Officer Alvarez on January 9, 2015.

<u>Charging Document for Officer Holding:</u> Issued and signed for by Officer Holding on January 9, 2015.

Charging Document for Officer Wells: Issued and signed for by Officer Wells on January 9, 2015.

Charging Document for Officer Sousa: Issued and signed for by Officer Sousa on January 9, 2015.

Copy of Fort Lauderdale Police Department Follow Appointment Letter to Officer Wells: Officer Wells was issued and signed the letter on January 23, 2015. He was scheduled for an appointment on January 28, 2015, at 10:00 AM. Officer Wells was afforded the opportunity to review new information related to the allegations and declined to supplement his statement.

Copy of Fort Lauderdale Police Department Follow Appointment Letter to Officer Sousa: Officer Sousa was issued and signed the letter on January 23, 2015. He was scheduled for an appointment on January 26, 2015, at 10:00 AM. Officer Sousa was afforded the opportunity to review new information related to the allegations and declined to supplement his statement.

<u>Copy of Officer Alvarez's City of Fort Lauderdale Employee Letter of Resignation and Clearance Sheet:</u> The letter was dated and submitted on January 21, 2015, and noted his resignation as "Effective Immediately." His last date of employment was listed as January 22, 2015.

#### CONCLUSION

- ➤ Officer Alvarez's former fiancée contacted the Fort Lauderdale Police Department and alleged several police officers were engaged in racist behavior. She provided her sworn statement as well as evidence consisting of text messages and an iMovie to support her claims.
- A potential criminal concern arose regarding a stolen automobile Officer Wells recovered. It was suspected Officer Wells may have authored a false report and engaged in a pursuit of a stolen car contrary to the Department's fleeing vehicle policy. Further investigation determined Officer Wells' official actions were within Department guidelines and was an accurate representation of the event.
- A review of the evidence revealed numerous derogatory statements directed towards specific groups of individuals. While the majority of the evidence included racially offensive language and images pertaining to African Americans, the officers also exchanged text messages that included derogatory comments towards Hispanics and homosexuals.
- Additionally, the evidence included messages and images critical of their coworkers' grammar, appearance and work ethic. The composition of the personnel criticized included various ethnicities and genders.
- Although Officer Alvarez tendered his resignation the day prior to his compelled statement, it was determined he created and distributed "The Hoods" iMovie.
- > Officers Alvarez, Holding, Wells, and Sousa authored and received the text messages which were attributed to each of their respective phone numbers.
  - o All four officers authored texts messages that were racially offensive toward African Americans.
  - o Officers Alvarez, Holding, and Wells authored texts messages maligning their coworkers.
  - o Officers Alvarez and Wells each utilized the derogatory term faggot.
  - Officer Holding described the female subject of a failed romantic endeavor as a "Fucking cuban" and "Fucking cuban elite."

Under the penalties of perjury, I declare that I have read the foregoing document and that the information contained within it is accurate to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Furthermore, I, the undersigned, do hereby swear, under penalty of perjury, that, to the best of my personal knowledge, information, and belief, I have not knowingly or willfully deprived, or allowed another to deprive, the subject of the investigation of any of the rights contained in ss. 112.532 and 112.533 Florida Statutes.

**INVESTIGATOR'S SIGNATURE:** 

CCN: